

**UNEP**

**COMPENDIUM OF SUMMARIES  
OF JUDICIAL DECISIONS IN  
ENVIRONMENT RELATED CASES**

**December 2004**

## INTRODUCTION

The Compendium has been developed in response to requests made by Chief Justices and senior Judges of over one hundred countries who participated in the UNEP Global Judges Symposium on Sustainable Development and the Role of the Judiciary, held in Johannesburg on the eve of the World Summit on Sustainable Development (WSSD) in August 2002, as well as over twenty five regional and national Judges Symposia on Environmental Law organised by UNEP during past few years. The outcome of this global initiative may be summarised as follows:

- Creation of a UNEP Global Alliance of Chief Justices and Senior Judges from over 100 countries, fully supportive of the UNEP Judges Programme and have declared their commitment to carry out capacity building of Judges **at national level** with the support of UNEP and its partner agencies,
- Creation of Regional Judges Forums for the Environment in Europe, Pacific, Southern Africa, Eastern and West Africa, the Arab States, the Francophone States and the Caribbean
- Development of a UNEP Judges Handbook and other Manuals/ case law books, including this Compendium, to respond to call from judiciaries of the developing world for urgently required books on environmental law. It became evident during the above mentioned global, regional and national judges meetings that most judges from developing countries do not have access to books on environmental law in their libraries. Some of these publications have also been translated to national languages (Chinese, Khmer, Lao and Vietnamese) at the request of national judiciaries.
- Mobilising a consortium of partners for the UNEP capacity building programme on environmental law of judiciaries, prosecutors, and other legal stakeholders. The organisations and institutions that have collaborated with UNEP in the above programme include, UNDP, the World Bank Institute, United Nations University, UNITAR, IUCN and its Academy of Environmental Law, Commonwealth

Secretariat, Francophone Secretariat, Commonwealth Magistrates and Judges Association, the Asia Foundation, the Hanns Seidel Foundation, Secretariat of the Pacific Regional Environment Programme (SPREP), South Asian Co-operative Environment Programme (SACEP), Environmental Law Foundation of the UK, Environmental Law Institute and the Centre for International Environmental Law.

- Commencement of systematic national training of judges through national judicial institutions with support of UNEP and partners agencies. While such national judges training programmes were held during 2004 in South Africa, Uganda, Tanzania, Vietnam, Cambodia, Lao PDR, plans are underway to hold similar national training workshops in over thirty countries during 2005.)

This compendium of judicial decisions in environment related cases consolidates earlier compendia published by UNEP in 1997 and 2002 and also includes summaries of several additional cases. It also includes a new index of cases by continent and, alphabetically, by country, as well as by subject matter. The indexes are contained in pages iii to xxvii. The case summaries themselves begin on page 1.

UNEP wishes to acknowledge the excellent work done by Professor Robert Lee of the University of Cardiff who edited the final version of the Compendium prepared by the staff of the DPDL Environmental Law Branch and also further developed the indexes. We also express our deep appreciation to the Rt. Hon. Lord Justice Robert Carnwath, Justice of the Court of Appeal of England and Wales, for writing the Foreword to this publication.

We sincerely hope that this Compendium and the other UNEP Environmental Law publications would contribute to meeting the information needs in the field of environmental law of judges and other legal stakeholders, especially in developing countries and countries with economies in transition.

Bakary Kante  
Director,  
Division of Policy Development and Law

# INDEX OF CASES

## AFRICA

### Ghana

1. [Felicia Adjui v The Attorney General, High Court of Justice, Suit No. Misc. 811/96 Ghana](#) 1

### Kenya

1. [Abdikadir Sheika Hassan & others v Kenya Wildlife Service Civil Case No. 2059,1996, High Court Kenya, Nairobi](#) 2
2. [Nairobi Golf Hotels \(Kenya\) Ltd v Pelican Engineering & Construction Co Ltd, Case No.706, 1997, High Court Kenya Nairobi](#) 3
3. [Paul Nderitu Ndungu & others v Pashito Holdings Ltd & Shital Bhandari, Case No.3063, 1996, High Court Kenya, Nairobi](#) 5
4. [Prof. Wangari Maathai Pius John Njogu John Makanga v City Council of Nairobi, Commissioner of Lands and Market Plaza Ltd, Case No. 72, 1994, High Court Kenya, Nairobi](#) 6
5. [Kinyua Njuguna v Karui Muthuita, Civil Case No. 1897/1980, Judgement on 27/10/86, High Court Kenya, Nairobi](#) 7
6. [Mirigo Mwangi v Wambura Mwangi, Misc. Application No. 5,1987, High Court Kenya,Nyeri](#) 8
7. [Nzasu Ndungu v Nzambulo Munyasya, Civil Appeal No. 27, 1989, High Court Kenya, Machakos](#) 9
8. [Stephen Thiongo Karanja v The Republic, Criminal Appeal No. 1593,1984, High Court Kenya, Nairobi](#) 10
9. [Rogers Muema Nzioka & others v Tiomin Kenya Ltd, Civil Case No. 97, 2001, Kenya](#) 11
10. [Lawrence Nginyo Kariuki v County Council of Kiambu, HCCC Misc. No. 1446, 1994, Kenya](#) 12
11. [Karanja Waweru v Gakunga Waitathu, Civil Case No. 1531, 1978, High Court Kenya, Nairobi](#) 13
12. [Wangari Maathai \(Greenbelt Movement\) v Kenya Times Media Trust, HCCC 5403, 1989, Kenya](#) 14
13. [Paul K. Nzangu v Mbiti Ndili, Civil Appeal No. 8, 1991, High Court Kenya, Machakos](#) 15
14. [Kenya Ports Authority v East African Power & Lighting Co Appeal No. 41, 1981, 9.3.82 Court of Appeal, Mombasa](#) 16

## **Mauritius**

1. [Ste Wiehe Montocchio & Cie v Minister of the Environment and Quality of Life, Case No.2/95, Mauritius Environment Appeal Tribunal](#) 17
2. [Movement Social De PetitCamp/Valentina v Ministry of the Environment and Quality of Life, Case No.2/94, Mauritius Environment Appeal Tribunal](#) 18

## **South Africa**

1. [Von Moltke v Costa Areosa \(Pty\) Ltd 1975 \(1\) \[CPD\] 255 South Africa](#) 19
2. [Van Huyssteen & others v Minister of Environmental Affairs & Tourism & Others 1996 \(1\) SA 283 \(c\) South Africa](#) 20
3. [Verstappen v Port Edward Town Board & Others, Case No. 4645/93 Durban & Coast Local Division, South Africa](#) 21
4. [Wildlife Society of Southern Africa & others v Minister of Environmental Affairs & Tourism & others, Case No. 1672/1995, South Africa](#) 22
5. [Minister of Health & Welfare v Woodcarb \(Pty\) Ltd & Another, 1996\(3\) SA 155, South Africa](#) 23
6. [Natal Fresh Produce Growers Association v Agroserve \(Pty\) Ltd 1990\(4\) SA 749, South Africa](#) 24
7. [Save the Vaal v The Director Mineral Development Gauteng Region; High Court of South Africa \(Witwatersrand Local Division\) Case No. 97021011 \(1997\), South Africa](#) 25
8. [Leonardia Safaris v Premier of Gauteng Province, High Court South Africa Witwatersrand Case No. 98/18201, South Africa](#) 26

## **Tanzania**

1. [Attorney General v Lohay Aknonaay, Civil Appeal No. 31 1994, Tanzania](#) 27
2. [Festo Balegele and 749 others v Dar Es Salaam City Council, Civil Cause No. 90 of 1991, Tanzania](#) 28
3. [Joseph D. Kessy and others v The City council of Dar Es Salaam, Tanzania](#) 29

## **Transkei**

1. [Wildlife Society v Minister Of Environment Transkei Supreme Court – 1996](#) 31

## **Uganda**

1. [British American Tobacco Limited v Environmental Action Network Ltd., Civil Appl. No. 27/2003 - Arising from Misc. Appl. No. 70/2002, High Court of Uganda at Kampala](#) 32
2. [Greenwatch Limited v. Attorney General and Uganda Electricity Transmission Company Ltd., HTC-00-CV-MC-0139 of 2001, High Court of Uganda at Kampala](#) 33
3. [Sibaji Waiswa v Kakira Sugar Work Ltd., MISC. APPLICATION NO. 230/2001- FROM CIVIL SUIT NO. 63/2001, High Court of Uganda at Jinja](#) 35
4. [The Environmental Action Network Ltd v The Attorney General and the National Environment Management Authority, Misc app. No. 39 of 2001, High Court of Uganda at Kampala](#) 36
5. [Greenwatch and Advocates Coalition for Development & Environment v Golf Course Holdings Ltd, Misc app No. 390/2001 \(from HCCS No. 834/2000\), High Court at Nakawa](#) 37
6. [Byabazaire Grace Thaddeus v Mukwano Industries, Misc app. No. 909 of 2000 \(Arising from Civil Suit No. 466 of 2000\), High Court at Kampala](#) 38
7. [National Association of Professional Environmentalists \(NAPE\) v Aes Nile Power Limited Respondent, misc. Case. No 268 of 1999, High Court at Kampala](#) 40

## **THE AMERICAS**

### **Canada**

1. [R v Varnicolor Chemical Limited Tri Union Chemical of Elmira and Severin Argenton, Director/Owner and Officers, \(1992\) 9 CELR. \(NS\) 177 Ontario Provincial Court](#) 41
2. [R v Bata Industries Limited and Others, \(1992\) 70 CCC \(3rd\) 395, Ontario Provincial Court](#) 42
3. [R v Blackbird Holdings Limited & George Crowe, Controlling Shareholder \(1990\) 6 CELR \(NS\) 119 Ontario Provincial Court](#) 44
4. [Attorney General, Quebec v Mark Levy, Lubrimax \(1982\) Inc. and D. M. Transport Ltd., Judgement Nos. 93-612, 93-613, 93-614, 93-615 1993, Jurisprudence Express No. 14 294-295](#) 45
5. [R v Tioxide Canada Inc, Turcotte, Eckersley, Gauthier, Lachance & Collingwood, Directors, \(unreported\), Quebec Court, 1993](#) 46
6. [R v Westmin Mines Ltd \(unreported\) BC Provincial Court](#) 47
7. [R v Aimco Solrec Limited, \(unreported\) Ontario Provincial Court](#) 48

8. [Re Sause Brothers Ocean Towing concerning an Oil Spill from the 'Nestucca' off the Coast of British Columbia, \(1991\) 769 F. Supp. 1147 \(Dor.\) United States District Court](#) 50
9. [R \(Environment Canada\) v R \(Northwest Territories Canada\) \(1993\)12 C.E.L.R. \(NS\) 55 Northwest Territories Territorial Ct](#) 52
10. [Recherches Internationales Quebec v Cambior Inc and Home Insurance and Golder Associes Ltd. 14 August 1998 Superior Court, Province of Quebec](#) 54

### **United States of America**

1. [Calvert Cliffs' Coordinating Committee v Automatic Energy Commission, United States Court of Appeals, District of Columbia, 449 F.2d 1109 \(1971\)](#) 55
2. [Scenic Hudson Preservation Conference v Federal Power Commission 354 F.2d 608 \(1965\)](#) 57
3. [Vermont Yankee Nuclear Power Corp v Natural Resources Defence Council 435 US 519.98 S. Ct. 1197](#) 58
4. [Just v Marinette County, 56 WIS.2D7 Nos. 106, 107, Supreme Court of Wisconsin](#) 59
5. [United States v Riverside Bayview Homes Inc 474 US 121: US Supreme Court](#) 60
6. [Fontainebleau Hotel Corp v Forty-Five Twenty-Five Inc., District Court of Appeal of Florida, 114 So 2d 357: 27.8.1959](#) 61
7. [Tennessee Valley Authority v Hill Supreme Court of the United States, \[437 US 153\] June 15, 1978](#) 62
8. [Tanner v Armco Steel Corporation, US District Court, Southern District, Texas \[340 F. Supp. 532\], 8 March 1972](#) 63
9. [The Village of Wilsonville v SCA Services, Inc. Supreme Court of Illinois \[426 N.E. 2d 824\], May 22, 1981](#) 64

10. [National Audubon Society V. Department of Water and Power of the City of Los Angles Supreme Court of California, \[658 P 2d 709\], February 17, 1983](#) 65
11. [Sierra Club Et. Alv. Coleman and Tiemann, 14 Ilm P.1425 \(1975\) & 15 Ilm P.L417 \(1976\), United States: District Court for the District of Columbia](#) 66
12. [Sierra Club v Morton, Supreme Court of the United States, 405 U.S. 727, 92 S.Ct. 1361\(1972\)](#) 69
- Antigua & Barbuda**
1. [The Barbuda Council v Attorney General & Others, High Court of Justice Antigua and Barbuda, Civil AD 1993](#) 70
- Argentina**
1. [Asociación Coordinadora de Usuarios, Consumidores y Contribuyentes v ENRE - EDESUR, Camara Federal de Apelaciones de La Plata, Sala 2a, July 8, 2003](#) 71
2. [Asociación Para la Protección del Medio Ambiente y Educación Ecológica "18 de Octubre" v Aguas Argentinas S.A. and Others, Camara Federal de Apelaciones de La Plata, Sala 2a, July 8, 2003](#) 72
- Brazil**
1. [Ministerio Publico v Orlando Linden and Hermes Gildo Masera, Tribunal of Rio Grande do Sul, April 30 1998](#) 73
2. [Ministerio Publico v olodymir Kysnichan, Federal Regional Tribunal of the 4<sup>th</sup> Region, August 8 1999](#) 75
3. [Ministerio Publico v Federal Union, Substitute Federal Judge of 2a Vara, State of Mato Grosso, January 19 1998](#) 77
4. [Pedro Korkowski v Ministerio Publico, Federal Regional](#) 79

预览已结束，完整报告链接和二维码如下：

[https://www.yunbaogao.cn/report/index/report?reportId=5\\_11449](https://www.yunbaogao.cn/report/index/report?reportId=5_11449)

