

Regional Enforcement Network for Chemicals and Waste (REN) Final Project Report

December 2011- February 2018

Law Division
UN Environment
Asia and the Pacific Office



Regional Enforcement Network for Chemicals and Waste



TABLE OF CONTENTS

1. Introduction.....	3
2. Executive Summary.....	3
3. Logical framework and key targets.....	7
Project design.....	7
4. Assessment of key activities and results.....	8
Overall objective	8
Activity area A: Technical assistance for problem solving.....	8
Activity area B: Information and Intelligence sharing.....	9
Activity area C: Enforcement operations and the enforcement awards	10
Activity area D: Networking and Awareness.....	11
Activity area E: Partnership for sustainability.....	12
5. Additional outcomes from the project.....	12
6. Additional challenges during implementation	13
Staffing.....	13
Project design and monitoring.....	13
Country engagement.....	14
7. Remaining challenges in the region.....	14
8. Proposal for a follow-on project.....	15
9. Conclusions and recommendations.....	15
Annex A - Project Logical Framework with Key Targets	17
Annex B: Terminal Review Findings, Lessons Learned and Recommendations	30

List of Acronyms and Abbreviations

ARPEC	Asia Regional Partners' Forum on Combating Environmental Crime
BAN	Basel Action Network
BC	Basel Convention on the Control of Transboundary Movements of Hazardous Wastes and Their Disposal
BCRC	Basel Convention Regional Centre
BRS	Basel, Rotterdam and Stockholm Conventions
CAP	Compliance Assistance Programme of UN Environment
CEN	Customs Enforcement Network under World Customs Organization
DTIE	Division of Technology, Industry and Economics of UN Environment
EIA	Environmental Investigation Agency
GCI	Green Customs Initiative
HCFC	Hydrochlorofluorocarbon
IMPEL	European Network for the Implementation and Enforcement of Environmental Laws
INECE	International Network for Environmental Compliance and Enforcement
MEA	Multilateral Environmental Agreement
MEA-REN	Multilateral Environmental Agreements Regional Enforcement Network
MP	Montreal Protocol on Substances That Deplete Ozone Layer
ODS	Ozone Depleting Substances
PANAP	Pesticide Action Network for Asia and the Pacific
PIC	Prior Informed Consent
POPs	Persistent Organic Pollutants
RC	Rotterdam Convention on the Prior Informed Consent Procedure for Certain Hazardous Chemicals and Pesticides in International Trade
REN	Regional Enforcement Network for Chemicals and Waste
RILO	Regional Intelligence Liaison Office of WCO
ROCB	Regional Office for Capacity Building of WCO
SAICM	Strategic Approach to International Chemicals Management
SC	Stockholm Convention on Persistent Organic Pollutants
SHP	Project "Sky Hole Patching"
Sida	Swedish International Development Agency
UN Environment	United Nations Environment Programme
UNODC	United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime
WCO	World Customs Organization

1. Introduction

This report presents the final project report for the Regional Enforcement Network for Chemicals and Waste (REN) project implemented by UN Environment. REN is a project that combatted environmental crime through strengthening the capacity of 25 participating countries in Asia Pacific to control illegal trade in chemicals and waste.¹ The project was financed with approximately USD \$1.57 million by the Swedish International Development Cooperation Agency, together with co-financing from other funding sources and donors. It commenced in December 2011 and formal activities ended in February 2018. Building on the 'Multilateral Environmental Agreements Regional Enforcement Network (MEA-REN)' project implemented between 2007 and 2011, its overall objective was to reduce illegal transboundary movement of chemicals and waste in Asia by improved enforcement cooperation and enhanced capacity-building of frontline enforcement officers at the national and the regional levels through a network.

Within the framework of this objective, the project had five priority areas with designated outputs: 1) Technical assistance for problem-solving; 2) Information and intelligence sharing; 3) Enforcement operations and the Asia Environmental Enforcement Award; 4) Networking and awareness, and 5) Partnership for sustainability. The Project Logical Framework with Key Targets is in **Annex A**. This report reviews the major activities and results of the project under these five output areas, and considers to what extent the overall objective and outputs were achieved. It also outlines an assessment of existing challenges in the region regarding illegal trade in chemicals and waste, and presents conclusions and recommendations for a follow-on project.

The report acknowledges an independent terminal review that was conducted in line with UN Environment policies and procedures, and a funding agreement for the project between the Government of Sweden and UN Environment. The terminal review assesses the project's performance in terms of relevance, effectiveness and efficiency and by determining outcomes and impact, including their sustainability. The review also provides a mechanism to promote operational improvements, learning and knowledge sharing both within and outside the network. The key conclusions and recommendations of the terminal review are reproduced in **Annex B**. UN Environment acknowledges the terminal review and broadly agrees with the key findings, lessons learned and recommendations. A formal management response is under preparation.

2. Executive Summary

UN Environment believes the project achieved important results in pursuit of its objective. Key achievements can be summarised as follows:

- a. **Seizures of over 865,000 tons of hazardous chemicals and harmful waste:** Significant seizures of illegally traded wastes and chemicals was achieved through improved intelligence exchange, training of 1476 frontline enforcement officers, and facilitation of five significant joint enforcement operations;

¹ Participating countries: Afghanistan, Bangladesh, Bhutan, Brunei Darussalam, Cambodia, China, Fiji, India, Indonesia, Iran, DPR Korea, R. Korea, Lao PDR, Maldives, Malaysia, Mongolia, Myanmar, Nepal, Pakistan, Philippines, Singapore, Sri Lanka, Thailand, Timor Leste, and Vietnam

- b. **Establishing national and regional communication pathways to facilitate enforcement:** Relationships have been forged between customs and environmental authorities through appointment of national focal points and organisation of networking events to build trust and engagement;
- c. **Facilitating inter-regional engagement to reduce waste trafficking:** REN has acted as a bridge between exporting and destinations countries, to more effectively and sustainably tackle illegal trafficking of waste, through inclusion of global partners in regional events and completion of joint enforcement operations;
- d. **Creating attitudinal change in enforcement agencies:** Green issues have been further prioritised by customs officers within the region because of increased training and awareness raising activities, the provision of practical enforcement tools and engagement with environmental authorities;
- e. **Integrating enforcement with gender and human rights:** Greater awareness has been cultivated of the links between gender, human rights and environmental issues, through inclusion of anti-corruption and gender issues in training activities and workshops, as well as greater participation of women in the network; and
- f. **Facilitating significant policy changes in some countries to stop waste trafficking:** Although not widespread, there has been a clear step-change in the policy and actions of some countries within the network, particularly China. If appropriately harnessed and replicated this could lead to real and lasting change within the region.

As summarized in the terminal review and below in table 1, of the 21 output level indicators in total, 16 were met and five partially met. Two out of the three project outcomes were fully achieved (outcome two and three below). Areas of notable success included training, development of supporting tools, networking events and joint enforcement operations.

However, whilst REN has built a strong foundation, there were some challenges – particularly around project design and others – that were identified during implementation. In addition, several improvement areas can be identified. If addressed, they could enable REN to move beyond awareness raising and relationship building to operating as a real network of enforcement partners that can achieve long-term, sustainable results. As identified in the terminal review and explained more fully in Annex B, these include: (a) Pinpointing partner capabilities; (b) Reducing barriers to intelligence exchange; (c) Encouraging greater collaboration; (d) Cultivating widespread ownership of enforcement issues; (e) Raising public awareness; and (e) Moving from awareness to action on social issues.

Table 1: Summary of Results Achieved Against Outcomes and Outputs

Project Outcome/ Objective	Indicators and Target	Results Achieved
Overall Outcome: reduced illegal transboundary movement of chemicals and waste	Number of seizures of ODS and hazardous waste reported by countries Target: 500 seizures	Total: 579 seizures (target met)

in Asia by improved enforcement cooperation and enhanced capacity building of frontline enforcement officers through a network	- Percentage of participating countries in enforcement operations Target: 50% of REN participating countries - Improved ability of the frontline customs officers and representatives of the broader enforcement personnel Target: 1000 enforcement officers trained/involved in capacity building workshops	44% in 2013, 83% in 2014 and 28% in 2017 (7 (targeted) Total: over 50% achieved in 2014 only (partially met) 781+ enforcement officers trained and 695+ participants in annual workshops and meetings from 2012-2017 Total: 1,476+ (target met)
Outcome 1: Improved ability of frontline customs officers and representatives of broader enforcement personnel		
Activity A: Technical assistance for problem solving		
Output: In-situ training	- Number of In-situ trainings delivered Target: 12 capacity building training workshops - Higher rating received in training evaluation Target: 90% participants rating good or excellent	Total: 17 (target met) Total: Over 90% for all years (target met)
Output: Hubs of enforcement capacity building institutes	Target: 8 regional workshops organised during 2013-2016 - Number of national customs training institutes in region with mandatory curriculum on environmental enforcement Target: 2 national customs training institutes	Total: 12 (target met) National Academy Customs Indirect Taxes and Narcotics India in 2017 Total: 1 (target partially met)
Activity B: Information and intelligence sharing		
Output: Data on transboundary movements of HSHW in the region	Data collected, analysed and utilised widely Target: data from 20 countries collected and analysed; 3 studies completed during 2013-2016	Survey completed per year from 2014-2017, results shared at annual workshop and in annual report. Total: 4 surveys, but unclear how many countries participated (target partially met)
Output: Platform to track HSHW transboundary movements	Number of suspicious shipments are provided with technical support Target: 90 traced	Total: 96 suspicious shipments traced from 2013-2017 (target met)
Output: Research on good practices - sound trade in chemicals and waste	Successful stories and good experiences shared Target: 20 countries/partner shared good practices and successful stories at annual	29 countries and 39 partners have shared their experiences at annual workshops from 2013-2017 Total: 68 (target met)

	workshops or through their submissions	
Output: REN website	Updated and active website Total: 12 website general updates each year (monthly); and 20 country updates	Target of 12 website updates met in 2014, 2015 and 2017. Only 4 updates carried out in 2013 and 1 in 2016. Reason in 2016 stated as lack of capacity and website maintenance. No results provided for country updates Total: 41 out of 48 website updates (target partially met)
Output: REN Newsflash	Number of REN Newsflashes (newsletters) produced and circulated Total: 12 issues a year (monthly)	Target of 12 met in 2014, 2015 and 2017. Only 4 issues produced in 2013, however newsflash was only launched in September of that year. Only 8 issues produced in 2016 due to lack of capacity Total: 48 out of 52 produced (target partially met)
Output: REN coverage in the partners' website/publications	Number of partners' websites publishing REN products Target: 3 partners' websites publishing REN's products	Total: 5 (target met)
Output: Regionalised tools for frontline officers to monitor and control trade in HSHW	Number of tools in different languages in region Target: 2 tools produced in 3 languages	1 enforcement handbook developed and translated into 3 languages 3 working papers developed and translated into at least 3 languages and 25 country information sheets. WATCH-IT application for mobile devices developed and released (2017) Total: 4 different tools developed, with 2 translated into 3 different languages each (target met)
Outcome 2: Higher profile of environmental crimes in participating countries' national legal framework/regulations and in strategic focus of regional partners		
Activity C: Enforcement operations and Asia Environmental Enforcement Award		
Output: Enforcement operations in the region	Number of operations carried out with the help of REN Target: 4 during 2014-2016	Total: 5 operations completed (target met)
Output: Asia Environmental Enforcement Award	Award ceremonies organised Target: 2 organised during 2014-2017	No progress in 2013 and 2014. Ceremonies organised in 2015 and 2017. 2016 ceremony organised but cancelled three weeks beforehand due to demise of King of Thailand. Total: 3 ceremonies organised (target met)
Outcome 3: Well-integrated and sustainable regional enforcement network for the benefit of national, regional and global groups		

Activity D: Networking and awareness		
Output: REN Network Workshops	Annual workshops organized Target: 5	1 organised per year from 2012 to 2017 Total: 6 (target met)
Output: Awareness events	Number of awareness events organised Target: 2	Total: 5 (target met)
Activity E: Partnerships for Sustainability		
Output: Strategy for long-term regional enforcement networking	Strategy elaborated and shared for consultation Target: 1 strategy paper developed	Discussion Paper and Brochure. Total: 1 (target met)
Output: Opportunities for synergies identified and pursued	- Number of voluntary customs training workshops organised by countries on environmental enforcement Target: 4 during 2014-2016 - Number of joint events and spin-off partnerships Target: 10	Total: 4 (target met) Total: 19 organised with partners (target met)

3. Logical framework and key targets

Project design

The original project document agreed in December 2011 included an initial logical framework that had limitations. The project outputs and outcomes were not clearly defined as specific, measurable, achievable, and realistic targets. However, in consultations with the donor this was addressed through the development of more measurable, targeted and realistic performance indicators in a revised logical framework and articulated through annual work plans discussed and agreed with the donor.

This revised framework was developed as part of UN Environment's application for a no-cost extension of the project, with amendments agreed on 31 March 2015 and incorporated into the 2014 Annual Report. Further revisions were made in 2016 through the formal integration of REN into the UN Environment's Programme of Work and development of a more substantive Project

预览已结束，完整报告链接和二维码如下：

https://www.yunbaogao.cn/report/index/report?reportId=5_14260

