# ENVIRONMENTAL RULE OF LAW

First Global Report





# Justice Swatanter Kumar (Retd.) Former Judge, Supreme Court of India Former Chairperson, National Green Tribunal

In Ancient Indian Philosophy, the concept of Vasudev Kutumbakam, a Sanskrit phrase meaning "the world is one family", finds frequent mentions and the concept of Environmental Rule of Law, as has been ardently brought forth in the report, can be traced to this ancient concept. Natural resources should be treated as global assets as juxtaposed with national property. Environment is a universal subject and environmental rule of law demands making the right to clean and decent environment fundamental to human existence, efficacious and expeditious across the globe.

The report individuates the governance system of various countries and simultaneously presses upon the conditional differences in various aspects of Environmental Management. The four pillars of sustainable development- economic, social, environmental and peace-is a well-placed need of the hour. The melancholic undertones of the reality must not overcome the various strides that we as populace of the world are taking towards becoming environmentally aware and developing our consciousness and conscience and towards this cause. It is this light of this advancement and strengthening that this report becomes extremely relevant in today's times.

I would like to congratulate the UN Environment for coming out with comprehensive and informative "Environmental Rule of Law: First Global Report" and wish them success.

#### Emmanuel Ugirashebuja, East African Court of Justice

"When everything else has been tested and yielded limited success, perhaps the only remaining much needed hope for salvaging the environment can only be found in espousing the concept of environmental rule of law especially in developing countries where consequences of environmental degradation are catastrophic."

## The Rt. Hon. Lord Carnwath of Notting Hill, CVO, Supreme Court of the United Kingdom

"I very much welcome the publication of this authoritative and comprehensive report. The Environmental Rule of Law is now an established concept. There is an urgent need for it to be applied in a practical and effective way by courts and administrators throughout the world. This report will make a valuable contribution."

## Terry Tamminen, President and CEO of the Leonardo DiCaprio Foundation

"The rule of law means that no one is above the law. This new report on the Environmental Rule of Law will help us improve compliance with environmental law, which is essential to ensuring protection of constitutional and human rights. As a U.N. Messenger of Peace, Mr. DiCaprio particularly supports legal protection of environmental defenders, especially indigenous peoples. During 2016, more than 200 environmental defenders were killed in 24 countries, with intimidation and violence affecting many more; a significant number of these were indigenous peoples."

"Many species' survival rests upon the success of environmental rule of law, which is why an increasing number of countries are extending legal rights or legal personhood to natural systems. As the United Nations has observed, living by the rule of law is critical to peace. It is a pre-requisite to the realization of all human rights."

## David Boyd, Special Rapporteur on Human Rights and the Environment

"This compelling new report solves the mystery of why problems such as pollution, declining biodiversity and climate change persist despite the proliferation of environmental laws in recent decades. Unless the environmental rule of law is strengthened, even seemingly rigorous rules are destined to fail and the fundamental human right to a healthy environment will go unfulfilled."

#### **Acknowledgments**

This report was drafted by Carl Bruch, Scott Schang, John Pendergrass, Scott Fulton, Nora Moraga-Lewy, Merideth Wright, and Greta Swanson of the Environmental Law Institute, under the direction of Arnold Kreilhuber, Elizabeth Mrema, Angela Kariuki, Allan Meso, and Lara Ognibene of the United Nations Environment Programme (UN Environment).

Research, drafting, design, and production support was provided by Sonia Ahmad, Naysa Ahuja, Azi Akpan, Leigh Barton, Mary Becker, Ethan Blumenthal, Aletta Brady, Isabel Carey, Lester Carver, Thien Chau, Serena Choi, Charlotte Collins, Kelsey Condon, Erin Daly, Gary Dresdin, Scott Drinkall, Davonne Flanagan, Talia Fox, Amalia Fuentes, Octavio Goio, John Hare-Grogg, Elana Harrison, Nafiseh Jafarzadeh, Carol Jones, Sierra Killian, Marcella Kim, Sam Koenig, Qiying Kuang, Michael Lerner, Charles Mack, James May, Kate McCormick, Emmett McKinney, Kathleen McLean, Caitlin Meagher, Mark Mlella, Kaly Moot, Isabelle Morley, Iris Moriyama, Laura Muse, Ashley Phillips, Lovinia Reynolds, Caroline Schiavo, Ambereen Shaffie, Lydia Slobodian, Kim Smaczniak, Samuel Smith, Taheer Tajani, Jessica Troell, Scott Vaughn, Jessye Waxman, Edith Brown Weiss, Sarah Wright, and Alda Yuan.

In addition to reviews by staff at UN Environment, the report benefitted from review and comments from David Boyd, Loretta Feris, Dan Magraw, Tianbao Qin, Charlotta von Troil, and several other governmental and nongovernmental reviewers. The views expressed in the final Report represent those of UN Environment, and do not necessarily reflect those of the reviewers.

© 2019 United Nations Environment Programme

January 2019

ISBN: 978-92-807-3742-4

Job number: DEL/2227/NA

This publication may be reproduced in whole or in part and in any form for educational or non-profit services without special permission from the copyright holder, provided acknowledgement of the source is made. UN Environment would appreciate receiving a copy of any publication that uses this publication as a source.

No use of this publication may be made for resale or any other commercial purpose whatsoever without prior permission in writing from UN Environment. Applications for such permission, with a statement of the purpose and extent of the reproduction, should be addressed to the Director, Communication Division, UN Environment, P. O. Box 30552, Nairobi 00100, Kenya.

The designations employed and the presentation of the material in this publication do not imply the expression of any opinion whatsoever on the part of United Nations Environment Programme concerning the legal status of any country, territory or city or its authorities, or concerning the delimitation of its frontiers or boundaries. For general guidance on matters relating to the use of maps in publications please go to <a href="http://www.un.org/Depts/Cartographic/english/htmain.htm">http://www.un.org/Depts/Cartographic/english/htmain.htm</a>.

#### Disclaimers:

Mention of a commercial company or product in this document does not imply endorsement by UN Environment or the authors. The use of information from this document for publicity or advertising is not permitted. Trademark names and symbols are used in an editorial fashion with no intention on infringement of trademark or copyright laws.

The views expressed in this publication are those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect the views of the UN Environment. We regret any errors or omissions that may have been unwittingly made.

© Maps, photos, and illustrations as specified.

This document may be cited as: UNEP (2019). Environmental Rule of Law: First Global Report.

United Nations Environment Programme, Nairobi.

## Environmental Rule of Law First Global Report

### **Table of Contents**

Foreword	<b>vi</b> i
Executive Summary	viii
1. Introduction	1
1.1 Overview	1
1.2 Benefits of Environmental Rule of Law	17
1.3 Core Elements of Environmental Rule of Law	20
1.4 Evolution of Environmental Rule of Law	26
1.5 Understanding and Addressing the Drivers of Environmental Compliance and	
Non-Compliance	30
1.6 Conclusion	33
2. Institutions	35
2.1 Introduction	35
2.2 Clear and Appropriate Mandates	45
2.3Coordination	49
2.4 Capacity Development	61
2.5 Information Collection, Management, and Use	63
2.6 Investigation and Enforcement	70
2.7 Environmental Auditing and Institutional Review Mechanisms	
2.8 Leadership	78
2.9 Opportunities and Recommendations	85
3. Civic Engagement	87
3.1 Introduction	87
3.2 Access to Information	98
3.3 Public Participation	116
3.4 Opportunities and Recommendations	135
4. Rights	137
4.1 Introduction	137
4.2 Right to a Healthy Environment	
4.3 Right to Nondiscrimination and Rights of Marginalized Populations	
4.4 Rights of Free Association, Free Expression, and Freedom of Assembly	
4 5 Opportunities and Decommendations	190

5. Justice	183	
5.1 Introduction	185	
5.2 Access to Justice	192	
5.3 Adjudications	200	
5.4 Effective Remedies	213	
5.5 Opportunities and Recommendations	222	
6. Future Directions	225	
6.1 Environmental Rule of Law and the Sustainable Development Goals	226	
6.2 Engaging Diverse Actors	229	
6.3 Regular Assessment of Environmental Rule of Law	234	
6.4 Pilot Testing of Approaches	237	
6.5 Way Forward	240	
Annex I: References Cited	243	
Chapter 1 (Introduction)	243	
Chapter 2 (Institutions)	249	
Chapter 3 (Civic Engagement)	257	
Chapter 4 (Rights)	264	
Chapter 5 (Justice)	271	
Chapter 6 (Future Directions)	276	
Annex II: International Instruments	280	
Annex III: Indices and Data Sources	282	



https://www.yunbaogao.cn/report/index/report?reportId=5\_14272

