

Ministry of Information and Communications, Bhutan

UNITED NATIONS
Economic and Social Commission for Asia and the Pacific

**NATIONAL STAKEHOLDER CONSULTATION AND
CAPACITY BUILDING WORKSHOP ON DEVELOPMENT OF
SUSTAINABLE AND INCLUSIVE TRANSPORT POLICY**

REPORT OF THE WORKSHOP
9-10 April 2015
Thimphu, Bhutan

Table of Contents

	Page
I. Introduction.....	1
II. Proceedings of the Workshop.....	2
III. Conclusions and Recommendations	9
IV. Concluding Session.....	10
Annex I: Programme of the Workshop.....	12
Annex II: List of participants.....	16

I. INTRODUCTION

A. Background

The Rio+20 Summit renewed global commitment to sustainable development and recognized that transport and mobility are central to sustainable development. In order to fulfill these commitments, Asian countries and cities need to adopt and implement various innovative policies, strategies and approaches thereby ensuring economic, environmental and social sustainability of transportation systems. The summit also urged United Nations regional commissions to prioritize sustainable development through, inter alia, more efficient and effective capacity-building, development and implementation of regional and national policy frameworks as appropriate, and exchange of information, best practices and lessons learned.

In this context the United Nations Economic and Social Commission for Asia and the Pacific (ESCAP) is implementing a programme to promote sustainable and inclusive transport policies in the developing countries in Asia. As part of this programme, on the request of the Ministry of Information and Communications (MoIC), Bhutan, a national consultation workshop was organized in Thimphu, Bhutan.

B. Organization of the workshop

The National Stakeholders' Consultation and Capacity Building Workshop on Development of Sustainable and Inclusive Transport Policy was held in Thimphu, Bhutan from 9 to 10 April 2015. The Workshop was organized by the United Nations Economic and Social Commission for Asia and the Pacific (ESCAP) and GIZ in collaboration with the Ministry of Information and Communications (MoIC), Bhutan.

The workshop objectives were to: (i) showcase various regional and global initiatives and policy options for development of sustainable and inclusive transport systems; (ii) share ideas, issues and experiences in building better, more sustainable and inclusive transportation systems and services; and (iii) work towards developing/refining a sustainable and inclusive transport policy for Bhutan. The programme of the Workshop is attached as Annex I to this report.

C. Attendance

The Workshop was attended by 52 multi-sector stakeholders representing various offices in Bhutan and resources persons. The participants included representatives of the MoIC, Ministry of Agriculture and Forests, Ministry of Home & Cultural, Ministry of Labour & Human Resources, Royal Bhutan Police, Department of Roads, Department of Civil Aviation, Road Safety and Transport Authority, National Environment Commission, Bhutan Postal Corporation, Gross National Happiness Commission Secretariat, Thimphu Municipality Thromde), Truckers Association and United Nations Development Programme. The list of participants is attached as Annex II to this report.

D. Opening of the workshop

1. **Dasho Kinley Dorji, Secretary, MoIC**, delivered an opening statement. He mentioned that the organization of this consultation workshop was very timely as the Ministry was

currently considering short term, medium term and long term vision and strategies for development of transport system as an enabler of economic development.

2. **Mr. Madan B. Regmi, Economic Affairs Officer, ESCAP**, highlighted the objectives of the workshop and invited stakeholders to interact with the resource persons, engage in discussions and utilize the opportunity provided by the workshop.

3. **H.E. Lyonpo D.N. Dhungyel, Minister, MoIC**, inaugurated the workshop. He mentioned that due to the topography Bhutan transportation system is limited to surface and air transport. He outlined that growing number of vehicles, congestion, emissions, and road accidents as some of the challenges faced by the transport sector. It was mentioned that the Ministry was working to develop a boarder policy framework to address the challenges by utilizing re-emerging technologies and through an integrated approach, which is currently dispersed and un-coordinated

II. PROCEEDINGS OF THE WORKSHOP

National experts and resources persons made presentations mentioned below. Each session was followed by active questions and answers sessions.

The statements and presentations made are available at:

<http://www.unescap.org/events/national-stakeholder-consultation-and-capacity-building-workshop-development-sustainable-and>

A brief account of presentations made during each session is presented below.

Session 1. Global and regional overview of sustainable transport policies

(Session chair Dasho Kinley Dorji, Secretary, MoIC)

1. The first presentation in this session was made by **Mr. Madan B. Regmi**. His presentation highlighted the renewed commitment expressed by member countries for transport and mobility at the Rio+20 Conference. It highlighted various approaches to enhance sustainability and inclusiveness such as taking integrated approach to transport and land use planning, use of energy efficient technologies, clean fuels and vehicles and promotion of public transport systems. He mentioned that transport related goals and targets are being included as part of the sustainable development goals. Once adopted by the United Nations General Assembly, there would be renewed impetus to implement sustainable transport policies. Outlining various policy options and examples that were being implemented by countries, it was highlighted that combination of policies would be required to move towards development of sustainable and inclusive transportation systems.

2. **Mr. Manfred Breithaupt, Senior Transport Policy Advisor, GIZ**, delivered a presentation on the concept of sustainable transport: planning and designing for sustainable and inclusive transportation systems. Mr. Breithaupt explained the adverse impacts of growth in motorization in economic, environment and social terms. He shared the urban transport challenges faced by developing cities and provided a comparison of the traditional approach of automobile centered and sustainable approach to improve access. He gave the examples and trends of the failures in urban and transport planning. This was against the background to

strive for more livable and attractive cities. Ingredients such as following the ASI (Activity, Structure and Intensity) approach and going for different lifestyles has been discussed. Integrated land use planning was introduced to be a decisive instrument towards achieving overall sustainability.

Session 2. National Sustainable Transport and Urban Transport Policies: Issues and Challenges

(Session chair: Mr. Lham Dorji, Director General, Road Safety and Transport Authority, MoIC)

1. **Mr. Sithar Dorji, Senior Planning Officer, MoIC**, delivered a presentation on current status of national transport policies, systems and projects in Bhutan. The presentation provided country background and overall national and transport policy context. The presentation highlighted that the main objective of transport policy was to increase access to safe, reliable, affordable, eco-friendly and convenient transport services including land, air, rail, ropeways and waterways. The presentation pointed out that the non-motorized transport system such as walking, bicycles and use of ponies were also used in the country. Further, the presentation covered bilateral and regional trade connectivity issues and eco-friendly transport initiatives. Toward the end, the presentation discussed issues and challenges faced by the transport sector in the country. Key issues included the fragmentation of roles and responsibilities of transport sector which spread over many government agencies, the absence of integrated transport policy, inadequate public transport, rapid motorization, the lack of technical capacity and human resources.

2. **Mr. Jangchuk Yeshe, Chief Engineer, Department of Roads, Ministry of Works and Human Settlements**, made a presentation on current status of road transport policies, systems and projects in Bhutan. His presentation highlighted that as a landlocked mountainous country, road is the primary mode of transport and the lifeline of the economy. The first highway was completed in 1961 and the road network currently has expanded to 10,578 km. His presentation showed the significant increase in the level of motorization. He shared various ongoing road projects as contained in vision 2020 milestone, the road sector master plan and the Bhutan Transport Vision 2040.

3. **Mr. Kelzang Tenzin, Department of Agriculture, Ministry of Agriculture and Forest (MoAF)**, presented the current status of rural access policies, systems and projects in Bhutan. In his presentation, Mr. Tenzin defined the farm roads as the roads linking farmland to main roads to enable the transportation of agricultural products and those were more than 1 km in length and served more than 20 households. He further explained about the selection and prioritization criteria of farm roads. Roles and responsibility of MoAF to develop and enforce farm road standards and guidelines, maintaining database of farm roads, coordinating the construction, monitoring key results as well as other crucial roles were highlighted.

4. **Mr. Mahesh Pradhan from Thimphu Thromde**, delivered a presentation on the challenges in transportation management and financing transportation system in Thimphu Thromde (City). Mr. Pradhan provided background of Thimphu city and highlighted the city's vision to become culturally vibrant, progressively safe and livable city. He also provided information about public transport which was started in 1970 and all public buses in Thimphu were government owned and currently managed by Bhutan Postal Corporation. Current roles and responsibility of Thimphu Thromde included providing sufficient parking

space as well as to operate and manage its contract, provide zebra-crossing and cycle tracks, install traffic control devices, provide highway lighting, and construct new roads and their road-side drainage. He also highlighted key issues and challenges faced by the city which included the lack of clear mandates and undefined roles and responsibilities, limited expertise in traffic engineering, lack of long-term action plan, and the need to undertake feasibility studies of non-motorized transport.

Session 3. Integrated transport planning and institutional coordination

(Session chair Dasho Kinley Dorji, Secretary, MoIC)

1. **Prof. Sanjay Gupta, School of Planning and Architecture, New Delhi**, delivered a presentation on the integrated national transport planning and policy formulation. The first part of the presentation focused on defining transport integration, the need for transport integration and the objectives of integrated transport planning. It further highlighted the stages of an integrated transport ladder and the hierarchy of interventions. Various stages of national transport planning were presented. The objectives of an integrated transport policy, institutional issues and various policy barriers were also highlighted.

The second part of the presentation focused on case studies of policy frameworks in India and Bhutan. The case study on India highlighted the reasons why India was moving towards integrated planning and the existing challenges confronting it. Recommendations of the National Transport Development Policy Committee (NTDPC) were highlighted that followed by a prescription for achieving an integrated transport and logistics strategy. The case study on Bhutan highlighted the transport vision and nine transport strategies. It was followed by various strategies related to road network, civil aviation, and passenger and freight transport strategy. The presentation concluded with imperatives for integration in transport sector, proposed outline of integrated transport objectives for Bhutan and suggestions for actions to be taken in developing integrated transport policies and strategies for Bhutan

2. **Mr. Regmi's** presentation on international freight transport, logistics and transport facilitation outlined the roles of transport links, nodes and services in moving freight and highlighted the importance of rail based intermodal services on moving freight more sustainably. The scope of improvement of the freight transport operation was highlighted with the aid of current logistics performance index (LPI) and concept of intermodal transport corridors that encompassed infrastructure, facilitation and operation was introduced. The presentation stressed the need to develop transport and logistics industry in Bhutan. Guidelines for minimum standards and professional codes of conduct for logistics and freight industry were introduced.

The second part of presentation focused on facilitation issues. The key provisions and benefits of joining seven international conventions recommended in the ESCAP resolution 48/11 were outlined. In the context of Bhutan integrated transport planning, improvement of transport and logistics infrastructure, development of additional transport corridors, harmonization of rules and procedures for transport and trade facilitation, acceding to international transport conventions, promotion of transport and logistics industry by engaging private sector and application of appropriate ICT were some of recommendation made in order to improve international freight transport.

3. **Prof. Shivananda Swamy, Professor, CEPT University**, made a presentation on institutional issues and policy Coordination and Integrated Land Use and Transport Plan: Experience from India. He stated that effective land use should be integrated in transport planning. He gave concerns about population growth and migration growth from rural areas to big cities and how to handle those emerging issues. The integrated and interactive link between land use and urbanization as well as transport planning can solve those mentioned issues. He also explained several important elements for effective land use such as local economic development plan, future economic activity and to make them connect with the transport planning. He shared an idea on 'designing for desirables/ strategic planning approach' as an alternate to predict-and-provide approach. Transport development, land management and city development plans should be integrated and considered the size of the city and density of the city to design appropriate operating system. He also categorized city level and local level land use plan to make balance in effective land management, for the development purpose. Development framework should be done through close cooperation and collaboration among relevant agencies. He concluded with emphasizing the need for identifying/establishing a 'Lead Agency' and empowering the same for achieving integrated transport objective.

4. **Mr. Breithaupt** gave another talk on institutional issues and policy coordination and integrated land use and transport plan: regional and global experiences. His presentation discussed the status quo of public transport in many developing cities as well as the requirements and expectations of citizens. The presentation elaborated on the main components of integrated urban transport, giving public transport a priority over all other modes on the road, non-motorized transport, creating/conserving of public space, public transport integration, transport demand management (TDM) measures and vehicles and fuels. The full chain of sustainable transport and its financing as well as the need to full integration of sustainable public transport modes was emphasized with the objective to offer attractive options against the use of motorized individual transport.

Session 4. Regional connectivity and air transport policies

(Session chair Mr. Sangay Tenzin, Officiating Director, DCA, MoIC)

1. **Mr. Regmi** in his presentation on regional transport connectivity in Asia highlighted the importance of regional transport connectivity to facilitate flow of goods, services, people, data and knowledge. The current status of regional transport connectivity comprising of international highways, railways and logistics centres was depicted highlighting the contribution of connectivity to the sustainable development and the need to make transport connectivity more sustainable. The importance of sustainable maintenance of transport infrastructure was also highlighted.

He stressed the importance of cross-border physical and operational connectivity and the need to improve physical connectivity to and from Bhutan by roads, rail links to the borders and through construction of dry port and logistics centres. He highlighted the need to enhance the roles of private sector in transport operations and the need to improve operational connectivity by acceding to international transport conventions, concluding and implementing bilateral trade and transport agreements and extending air service agreements.

2. The presentation on air transport planning and policy formulation delivered by **Prof. Gupta** was divided into two parts. In the first part the focus was on describing elements of air

transport system, factors contributing to air traffic growth and air travel markets at different stages of development. It further highlighted the concept of hub and spoke system, various components of an airport and its classification system. Air transport demand forecast approach was presented followed by broad land area requirements for an airport. The second part of the presentation focused on case studies of aviation policy frameworks of India and Bhutan. While presenting the case study on India it presented a broad overview of major airports in India followed by major policy highlights of National Transport Development Policy Committee (NTDPC) of India including preparation of National Master Plan for airports, creation of Civil Aviation Authority, setting up of fully autonomous Accident Investigation and Safety Board etc. The case study on Bhutan highlighted various policy measures such as enhancing safety and security, developing domestic and international air services, upgrading airport infrastructure and strengthening of institutional capacity. The presentation concluded with an emphasis to ensure that air investment plans are responsive to changing traffic demand and it should be seen as an integral component of multi-modal transport system. A network centric approach to planning air transport is imperative and in case of Bhutan all existing and proposed airports should have good integrated land transport connectivity.

3. **Mr. M. Absar Alam, Senior Fellow, Asian Institute for Transport Development (AITD)**, spoke on rural connectivity. He mentioned that a sustainable transport system needs a clear approach to strengthen rural connectivity. Farm roads were basically the main rural roads in the country. Despite significant progress in farm roads in terms of its length, the roads were still unpaved and poorly constructed as well as maintained. They were integrated with major roads that connect districts and primary highways. In addition, transport infrastructure further required access of proper transport services to rural population. These services would be able to facilitate access to social infrastructure. Therefore, access to social infrastructure like hospitals, schools and other villages still remained to be provided. In order to achieve inclusiveness and sustainability in transport, rural population needed to be connected with the transportation system. He highlighted that the strategies to achieve rural connectivity require institutional strengthening at national level. Such institution needed to be equipped with proper financing mechanism and supported by technical capabilities. A uniform technical guideline for all the farm roads across the country for construction, maintenance along with a uniform operational manual for rural transportation would be useful. Lessons may be drawn from other countries like India which carried out extensive programme for rural connectivity. It created a central agency to design uniform standards and operational manual, monitoring mechanism had also been developed. Rural connectivity programmes were being implemented by district level of implementation units in the country.

预览已结束，完整报告链接和二维码如下：

https://www.yunbaogao.cn/report/index/report?reportId=5_4196

