

# Interim Evaluation Urban-LEDS Project Synthesis Report

September 2015









# Interim Evaluation Urban-LEDS Project Synthesis Report









## Interim Evaluation

## **Urban-LEDS Project**

Synthesis Report

First published in Nairobi in September 2015 by UN-Habitat Copyright © United Nations Human Settlements Programme 2015

All rights reserved
United Nations Human Settlements Programme (UN-Habitat)
P.O.Box 30030, 00100 Nairobi GPO KENYA
Tel: +254-20-7623120 (Central Office)
www.unhabitat.org

HS Number: HS/076/15E

An electronic version of this publication is available for download from the UN-Habitat website at http://www.unhabitat.org

### Disclaimer

The designations employed and the presentation of the material in this publication do not imply the expression of any opinion whatsoever on the part of the Secretariat of the United Nations concerning the legal status of any country, territory, city or area or of its authorities, or concerning the delimitation of its frontiers of boundaries. Views expressed by authors in this publication do not necessarily reflect those of the United Nations, Human Settlements Programme, the United Nations, or its Member States. References to names of firms and commercial products and processes does not imply their endorsement by the United Nations, and a failure to mention a particular firm, commercial product or process is not a sign of disapproval.

Excerpts may be reproduced without authorisation, on condition that the source is indicated.

### **Acknowledgements**

The present Interim Evaluation of the Urban-LEDS Project consolidates information gathered during missions carried out to each of the participating countries. This Report has been made possible by the dedicated participation of the Urban-LEDS Project Country Teams in Indonesia, India, South Africa and Brazil, and with the support of the ICLEI World Secretariat, and of United Nations Human Settlements Programme (UN-Habitat).

Supervisor: Robert Kehew (UN-Habitat) and Maryke van Staden (ICLEI)

Author: Earl Kessler

Support: Cerin Kizhakkethottam and Jayne Kimani

Editor: Tom Osanjo
Design and Layout: Freddie Maitaria

Printer: UNON, publishing services section, Nairobi.

ISO 14001:2004-certified

# Table of Contents

List of Fig	ures, Tables and Images	i\
Acronyms	and Abbreviations	\
Executive	Summary	vi
1. Introductio	on	1
2. Overview .		3
3. Evaluation	Approach and Methodology	5
3.1 Limita	tions	6
4. Main Findi	ngs	7
4.1. Work	Package 1: Project Management and Coordination	10
4.2. Work	Package 2: Designing Urban-LEDS	11
4.3. Work	Package 3: Implementing Urban-LEDS	15
4.4. Work	Package 4: Global Exchange Framework	28
4.5. Work	Package 5: Urban-LEDS Support	30
4.6. Work	Package 6: Global Database of Urban NAMAs	33
4.7. Work	Package 7: Global Climate Advocacy	34
5. Evaluative	Assessment of the Evaluation Criteria	37
•	ess of Cities' Achievements to Date	
5.2 Progre	ess of Normative/Global Level Engagement	38
5.3 Releva	ance	38
5.4 Efficie	ncy	38
5.5 Effecti	iveness	38
5.6 Integra	ation of Gender and Environmental Aspects	39
6. Evaluative	Conclusions	41
7. Lessons Le	arned	43
8. Recommen	dations	45
Annexes		49
Annex I:	Terms of Reference	50
Annex II:	Model and Satellite Cities	55
Annex III:	Questions to be addressed	56
Annex IV:	Interview Questions	57
	List of People interviewed and consulted	
	Country Programmes Expenditures until 31 December 2014	
	: Project's Logical Model	
	I: Results Logical Framework and Performance Tracking Matrix	
Annex VIII	I: Results Logical Framework and Performance Tracking Matrix (continued)	64

# List of Figures, Tables and Images

i		-					
ı	10	ct.	of	ы	a	Пr	ΔC
ı	ы.	sι	UI		u	uı	CJ

Figure 1:	Urban-LEDS countries and cities worldwide	2
Figure 2:	The GreenClimateCities (GCC) Process Methodology	.11
Figure 3:	Urban-LEDS Model and Satellite Cities in Brazil	.19
Figure 4:	Greenhouse Gas Inventory of the Model Cities Fortaleza and Recife	.19
Figure 5:	Urban-LEDS Model and Satellite Cities in South Africa	.20
Figure 6:	Greenhouse Gas Inventory of the Model Cities KwaDukuza and Steve Tshwete	.21
Figure 7:	Urban-LEDS Model and Satellite Cities in India	.22
Figure 8:	Greenhouse Gas Inventory of the Model Cities Rajkot and Thane	.23
Figure 9:	Urban-LEDS Model and Satellite Cities in Indonesia.	.24
Figure 10:	Greenhouse Gas Inventory of the Model Cities Bogor and Balikpapan	.25
Figure 11:	Energy Saver Units (ESU) for Street Light in Rajkot – a Urban-LEDS pilot project implemented in Rajkot, India	.26
Figure 12:	The carbonnClimateRegistry is designed as the global response of local and subnational governments towards measurable	e,
	reportable, verifiable (MRV) climate action.	.33
List of Ta		
Table 1:	Project budget for the four country programmes	
Table 2:	Sectorial-specific expenditures until 31 December 2014 for the four ICLEI Offices	.28
List of Ir	nanas	
Image 1:	ICLEI Africa	0
Imaga 2:		0
Image 2:	Project Advisory Group meeting in India consisting of leading private sector companies in the Renewable Energy and	
	Energy Efficiency sector, GIZ, the German Development Bank (KfW) and the European Commission, paving the way for private sector cooperation	^
l	·	9
Image 3:	The first National Project Advisory Group (PAG) meeting in South Africa provided an opportunity for Urban-LEDS	
	stakeholders from across South Africa to hear about progress and provide advice for effective further	12
I 4.	implementation.	. 12
Image 4:	The national meeting on Climate Change in Belo Horizonte, Brazil was the stage for the 5th meeting of the CB27 Forum	17
I F.	and the gathering of representatives of the Brazilian Urban-LEDS cities together with ICLEI and UN-Habitat	
Image 5:	Zero bins for zero waste: a ward in India Urban-LEDS Satellite City Coimbatore becomes bin-free.	
-	The Urban-LEDS city practitioners at HEAT+ training in Indonesia: A tailor-made tool for managing emissions	. 14
Image 7:	Train the Trainer course on, 'Introduction to the Hotbox' in South Africa. The workshop was intended to build skills,	
	knowledge and capacity to champion the rollout of an exciting new initiative and to introduce more energy efficient	1 5
l 0.	food preparation among other sustainable benefits	. 15
Image 8:	City officials together with ICLEI and UN-Habitat experts at the 2nd Urban-LEDS International Networking Seminar in	25
l 0.	Bogor, Indonesia May 2015.	.25
Image 9:	Robert Kehew, UN-Habitat outlining recommendations for addressing the urban sector in national climate change policy	20
I	at the 1st Urban-LEDS International Network Seminar in South Africa, November 2013.	.29
ımage 10:	Urban-LEDS participants at COP-19 in Warsaw, Poland: Multi-level partnerships for promoting advocacy, scaling up local	~ -
I	action and mainstreaming Climate Action towards a low carbon economy.	.34
ımage 11:	ICLEI's Maryke van Staden introducing the 'carbonn Cities Climate Registry' (cCR) at the Bonn Climate Change	٦.
	Conference, 2013	.35

# Acronyms and Abbreviations

**APEKSI** Indonesian Local Government Association

AS ICLEI Africa Secretariat

**BAPPENAS** Indonesia Ministry of National Development Planning

BPLH Indonesia Environmental Agency
CB27 Capitals of Brazil 27 States
cCR carbonn Climate Registry
CNG Compressed Natural Gas
COMPACT Compact of Mayors
COP Conference of Parties

DEA Department of Environmental Affairs (South Africa)

DNPI National Council for Climate Change of Indonesia

**ESCo** European Commission
Energy Service Company

**GCC** ICLEI's GreenClimateCities programme

**GHG** Greenhouse Gas

**GIZ** German Cooperation Development Agency

GIZ SUTIP German Cooperation Development Agency for Sustainable Urban Transport Improvement Project

**GPC** Global Protocol for Community-Scale Greenhouse Gas Emission Inventories

**GRIP** Greenhouse Gas Regional Inventory Process

**HEAT+** Harmonized Emissions Analysis Tool

ICCC International Conference on Climate Change
ICLEI ICLEI-Local Governments for Sustainability

**IE** Interim Evaluation

**ISOCARP** International Society of City and Regional Planners

**LED** Low Emissions Development

LOCS Low Emissions Development Strategies
Local Climate Solutions for African Congress

Land Use Management System

MRV Measurable Reportable Verifiable

**NAMAs** Nationally Appropriate Mitigation Actions

**NGO** Non-Governmental Organization

PAG Project Advisory Group
PPP Public-Private Partnership
RLF Results Logical Framework

**SALGA** South African Local Government Association

SAMS

ICLEI South American Secretariat

SAS

ICLEI South Asia Secretariat

SEA

Sustainable Energy Africa

SEAS

ICLEI South East Asia Secretariat

SIER

Synthesis Interim Evaluation Report

**SR** Synthesis Report

**UFPE** Federal University of Pernambuco

**UNFCCC** United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change

UN-Habitat United Nations Human Settlement Programme
Urban-LEDS Urban Low Emission Development Strategies
V-NAMAs Vertically Integrated NAMAs (see above)



https://www.yunbaogao.cn/report/index/report?reportId=5\_18572

