

External Evaluation of UN-HABITAT's Water and Sanitation Trust Fund

Part 2: Regional and Country Reports

March 2011

Zozan Kaya

Anton Rijdsdijk

Hugo Roche

Table of Contents

1. India & Ethiopia.....	2-15
2. Lake Victoria.....	16-63
3. Mekong.....	64-89
4. Latin America.....	90-167

Country Report Ethiopia and India

Zozan Kaya

Table of Contents

ABBREVIATIONS

INTRODUCTION	4
1.1. CASES AND EXPERIENCE FROM ETHIOPIA	4
1.2. SANITATION IMPROVEMENT PROJECTS	4
1.3. SCHOOL PROGRAMME AWARENESS RAISING “GAY MADRASA”	6
OVERALL FINDINGS ON ACHIEVEMENTS AND RESULTS IN INDIA	6
CASES AND EXPERIENCE FROM INDIA	7
1.4. NATIONAL HOUSING BANK	8
1.5. SULABH INTERNATIONAL SOCIAL SERVICE ORGANISATION	9
1.6. VISITS TO SLUMS IN INDORE, BHOPAL AND GWALIOR	9
OVERALL FINDINGS ON ACHIEVEMENTS AND RESULTS IN INDIA	10
ANNEX 1: REFERENCES	14

Abbreviations

ASCI	Administrative Staff College of India
ADB	Asian Development Bank
CMWSS	Community Managed Water Supply Scheme
CTA	Chief Technical Advisors
DDSBA	Dire Dawa Sanitation Beautification Agency
DDWSSA	Dire Dawa Water Supply & Sewerage Authority
GMS	Gender Mainstreaming Strategies
HQ	Head Quarter
HVWSHE	Human Value in Water Sanitation and Hygiene Education
HWSSA	Harar Water Supply and Sewerage Authority
MDG	Millennium Development Goal
M&E	Monitoring & Evaluation
Microsan	Micro credit for Sanitation
MP	Madhya Pradesh
MSF	Multi Stakeholders Forum
NGO	Non Governmental Organization
NHB	National Housing Bank
RWH	Rain Water Harvesting Tank
SESI	Slum Environmental Sanitation Initiative
UN-HABITAT	United Nations Human Settlements Programme
UNSWEEP	Urban Water Supply & Environmental Improvement Project
WATSAN	Water and Sanitation
WAC	Water for African Cities Programme
WAC	The Water for Asian Cities Programme
WDM	Water Demand Management
WASH	Water, Sanitation and Hygiene
WSTF	Water and Sanitation Trust Fund

1. Introduction

The report is based on field visits to Ethiopia (November 25th, 2010) where the consultant undertook two days of fieldtrips as part of the external evaluation of the Water and Sanitation Trust Fund (WSTF). The mission in India took place in the period January 14th- January 20th, 2011. Chief Technical Advisor and his colleague from UN-Habitat in India facilitated the consultant's visit. The consultant executed a series of interviews with various partners and local organisations in Delhi, and the cities of Madhya Pradesh; Indore, Bhopal and Gwallior. This also included visits to many of the slums that are targeted in the Water for African Cities Programme (WAC). The purpose of the report is to present and discuss the experiences of selected projects from the two countries. As such, these case studies seek to describe the main characteristics of the projects, the achievements, moreover, the lessons learned for UN Habitat.

1.1. Cases and Experiences from Ethiopia

Since 1999, UN-Habitat has assisted African countries to improve the management of water and sanitation (WATSAN) through the WAC Programme. The main objective of the WAC is to tackle the urban water crisis through efficient and effective water demand management, build capacity to mitigate the environmental impacts of urbanization on freshwater resources and boost awareness and information exchange on water management and conservation. The second phase of the WAC Programme was launched in December 2003 with the focus to assist in the international effort to reduce poverty as embodied in the goals and targets of the Millennium Declaration and other United Nations commitments (RGA Synthesis Report: WAC II, 4). In Ethiopia, implementation of WAC II started in 2005.

1.2. Sanitation Improvement Projects

“Dire Dawa Urban Sanitation Improvement”

The Dire Dawa Urban Sanitation Improvement is funded by UN-Habitat with USD 51,500 and co-financed by DDSBA with USD 5,000, further, implemented by Dire Dawa Sanitation Beautification Agency (DDSBA). The objectives of the project has been to construct public toilets and a shower service complex near by the old railway station with a total number of beneficiaries stated as up to 30,000. Some of the achievements include the training of 40 small scale service providers in waste collection; and provision of solid waste disposal facilities (2 garbage bins and 20 mobile waste collection equipments).

Observations: The project effectively targets an area that is frequented by many people on a daily basis, thus delivers the overall objective of the project, namely to contribute towards the improvement of the sanitation conditions of the city. Further, the sanitation complex has been given to operators who are unemployed, the latter forming an association which is able to generate profits from the running of facilities. Yet, a challenge that remains is septic waste removal, a procedure that is costly. More attention needs to be put on this issue.

“Small scale community based water supply & sanitation project for Goro-Sabian and Gende-Gerada Communities”

The above project has been implemented by Dire Dawa Water Supply & Sewerage Authority (DDWSSA). Here, mobile toilets have been installed in the outskirts of Dire Darwa. The daily running of the facility has been outsourced to youth members of the area through their association.

In another informal setting, public water points have been installed in the peri-urban settlements of Dire Dawa. These informal settlements were suffering from poor water supplies prior to interventions. There was a lack of solid waste collection, and people here paid more for provision of

water than in other areas. In a settlement like this, typically 4000 people would live, yet, numbers remain unofficial. The government can at any time erase or decide to build roads through the area as none of the settlements are “legally built”. As such, when selecting vulnerable communities, UN Habitat officials found that it was critical to address this area.

More specifically, achievements have been the provision of 4 mobile toilets (benefiting up to 200 people per day), 4 solid waste/garbage collection bins and construction of community toilet complex including shower facilities. Further, the construction of 8 public water supply points is stated as benefiting over 5000 people. The project has also included the training of 25 public tap operators.

Observations: The pro-poor rationale and location of infrastructure seems well balanced. Furthermore, the target beneficiaries are poor groups and communities, representing the most vulnerable on the beneficiary level. As mentioned above, more attention needs to be put on the septic waste removal. An important albeit not resolved issue is the lack of land rights of poor residents in poor urban informal settings. Through UN Habitat’s involvement, the municipal authorities have shown a will to cooperate, allowing the construction of facilities but also subsidizing and monitoring developments. For instance, the Dire Dawa City Administration's role has been overseeing all the projects implemented by different implementing partners of the city. This is a positive development that may enhance the rights of poor and landless, and suggests that UN Habitat’s models are welcomed and aligned with local authorities. The potential for future replication of the models is thus high.

“Small Scale Community Based Water Supply and Sanitation Improvement Project for ‘Dehoch’ Community in Harar”

The Implementing Partner has been Harar Water Supply and Sewerage Authority (HWSSA). The achievement in this community development project has been the installation of water supply and sanitation facilities and rain water harvesting tank (RWH). “Gava Ule (formerly known as “Dehoch”), was targeted because these people are amongst the most vulnerable of the poor in Harar. Further, Gava Ule Community represents one of the oldest informal settlements of the city. There are more than 300 families living here at any one time. The project component actively involved the community members as daily laborers, during the installation of the water pipe lines. On average, they have generated about 3167 birr as income (Harar HWSSA Report,2009). The community organized themselves in the “Gava-Ule WATSAN Association”; in order to manage both water and sanitation issues as well as the commercial aspect. They have managed to generate an income through the operation of the toilets and water tank, and are now selling water and sanitation services to the outer villages. Income from the latter is reportedly approximately 20 000 birr.

Observations: The project addresses the priority needs of the most vulnerable groups, beneficiaries have been selected by UN-Habitat staff and the selection criteria and location seem well considered. It is community driven and has thus contributed to a strong ownership feeling, given that the community groups are involved in installing, managing and maintaining the facilities. Extending upon this, the fact that they are able to generate an income from sales of water (establishing a small kiosk) is both innovative and a model that could potentially easily be replicated elsewhere.

The provision of the WATSAN facilities such as public water points, toilet facilities (both types), solid waste collection garbage bins have therefore been a significant contribution in alleviating problems the communities were facing, and the number of beneficiaries testify to this fact. The conditions could however be improved. The building that 300 people were living in was in a very dire condition and people had to sleep in turns due to lack of space. There is in other words scope for improvement in community development in Ethiopia.

1.3. School Programme-Awareness Raising “Gay Madrasa”

Implementing partner in this values based approach has been Harari Bureau of Education. At the commencement of the project, in 2006, 5 pilot schools were selected consisting of 4,112 students and 132 teachers for the participation of the WASH programme. On the technical supply side, there has been construction of water supply facilities such as a water point operator and a rain water harvesting tank. The programme also involves curriculum integration and model development; that is, training of teachers and community representatives on human values in water, sanitation and hygiene education. According to the Harar Region Education Sector Development Program, around 85% of the available schools in the region do not have drinking water supply and a majority of schools lack separate toilets for girls, boys and teachers (Harar City RGA Final Report, 2005, 33). In this sense, the selection of locations and target groups seem relevant and well considered.

Observations: The rationale of creating a new ethic among children, utility staff and the community-at-large is appealing, however, given that the programs focus on public and community managed schools, the places that the poorest of the poor send their children. It is moreover a positive step that value based education is being incorporated into curricula of schools, as in Ethiopia.

One issue that needs further clarification is whether installing RWH tanks in schools is considered as good value for money. These harvesting tanks normally have the capacity of 25 to 50³. Constructions are installed in an appropriate manner, however, a general impression is that many of the tanks are not being used to fullest potential, others again are not easy to maintain due to lack of maintenance trainings or technical quality. What is more, RWH is highly dependent on weather conditions, meaning that their usage is scarce in non-rainy seasons. As such, the question may be posed; to what extent is this cost-beneficial, moreover a relevant intervention in schools, elderly centers, and prisons?

2. Overall Findings on Achievements and Results in Ethiopia

Water Demand Management

- A total of nine (eight in Dire Dawa and one in Harar) Public Water Points constructed for the targeted poor communities. These public water points are serving an estimated number of 5,400 people (5,000 in Dire Dawa and 400 in Harar) at the moment. In Addis Ababa 10 communal water points that are benefiting about 8,000 people are constructed. In addition, in Addis Ababa 1311 shared yard connections benefiting 20,976 people are constructed.
- The construction of 15 rainwater harvesting tanks with the capacity of 25 to 50 m³ has been completed. These schemes are located in pilot schools, community centers and prisons. The total number of beneficiaries are estimated to be 9,820. Under the capacity building component of the project training manuals, technical guidelines, operation and maintenance manuals have been developed and are in use by the authorities for further rainwater harvesting initiatives.

Sanitation for the Urban Poor

- In all the three participating cities public toilets (one per city) have been constructed. These facilities are providing services for the urban poor that are targeted through the programme.

- Apart from the public toilet complexes, six mobile toilets (four for Dire Dawa and two for Harar) have been constructed.

Awareness Raising and Water & Sanitation Education

- Awareness and sensitization of the community as well as consultation of the community members on their priority needs with respect to water and sanitation services.
- Sensitization of policy decision makers was carried out at federal, regional governments as well as city-levels.
- Baseline survey of the pilot schools completed and reports produced.
- Trainings on Human Value in Water Sanitation and Hygiene Education (HVWSHE) was given for participants selected from the three cities for 12 consecutive days in Addis Ababa.

Regarding the impact on the direct beneficiaries, it is clear that the communities are actively participating in the projects, moreover, that capacity building and community approaches have generated enthusiasm in Ethiopia. As mentioned above, in the informal settlement “Gava Ule” in Harar, about 300 community members are directly benefiting from the provision of facilities, also generating a sustainable income through the operation of the latter. In this sense, the community based water and sanitation project seems to be a commendable attempt in addressing the pressing issues. The emphasis on community development approaches further allow the poor to have a voice and participate in project implementation and collective decision making, as well as giving them ownership to the project. This coincides well with the stated program goal, namely to increase the power and voice of the urban poor (HWSSA Completion Report, 2009,7). At the same time however, some projects in Ethiopia are in relatively early stages of development and there is thus scope for improvement, especially for community development.

3. Cases and Experiences from India

The Water for Asian Cities Programme (WAC) is a collaborative initiative of the UN-Habitat, the Asian Development Bank (ADB) and several countries in Asia. The Government of India is a partner in the programme. The programme was launched in March 2003. Its main objective is to promote pro-poor investments in water and sanitation to support MDG's in Asian cities, specifically promoting pro-poor governance, water demand management, increased attention to environmental sanitation; and income generation for the poor linked to water supply and sanitation.

UN Habitat's Interventions in Madhya Pradesh (MP)

预览已结束，完整报告链接和二维码如下：

https://www.yunbaogao.cn/report/index/report?reportId=5_18893

