

Evaluation Report 5/2019



KABUL STRENGTHENING MUNICIPAL NAHIAS PROGRAMME (KSMNP)

MID-TERM PROGRAMME EVALUATION

JANUARY 2019

DISCLAIMER

The designations employed and the presentation of the material in this publication do not imply the expression of any opinion whatsoever on the part of the Secretariat of the United Nations concerning the legal status of any country, territory, city or area or of its authorities, or concerning the delimitation of its frontiers or boundaries.

Views expressed in this publication do not necessarily reflect those of the United Nations Human Settlements Programme, the United Nations, or its Member States.

Excerpts may be reproduced without authorization, on the condition that the source is indicated.

Acknowledgements

Author: Hakan Demirbuken (Consultant)

Front cover photo: Kabul © UN-Habitat

Table of Contents

| | |
|--|-----------|
| Abbreviations and acronyms..... | 4 |
| Executive Summary..... | 5 |
| 1. Introduction..... | 12 |
| 1.1 <i>Background and context to the Kabul Strengthening Municipal Nahias Programme ..</i> | 12 |
| 1.2 <i>Evaluation mandate.....</i> | 14 |
| 1.3 <i>Purpose, Objectives and Use of the Mid-term Evaluation</i> | 14 |
| 1.4 <i>Scope.....</i> | 15 |
| 1.5 <i>Theory of Change.....</i> | 15 |
| 2. Evaluation Methodology..... | 17 |
| I. <i>Desk Review</i> | 17 |
| II. <i>In-Depth Interviews with Project Stakeholders.....</i> | 18 |
| III. <i>Field Visits and Observations.....</i> | 18 |
| IV. <i>Survey with Project Beneficiaries (Property Owners).....</i> | 18 |
| 3. Evaluation Limitations..... | 18 |
| 4. Evaluation Findings | 19 |
| 4.1 <i>Progress towards the expected results.....</i> | 19 |
| 4.2 <i>Relevance</i> | 19 |
| 4.3 <i>Effectiveness.....</i> | 20 |
| 4.4 <i>Efficiency.....</i> | 26 |
| 4.5 <i>Impact</i> | 28 |
| 4.6 <i>Sustainability.....</i> | 31 |
| 4.7 <i>Cross Cutting Issues.....</i> | 32 |
| 5. Challenges Faced During the KSMNP Implementation | 32 |
| 6. Conclusion..... | 33 |
| 7. Lessons Learned..... | 38 |
| Annex I: Terms of Reference | 40 |
| Annex II : Household survey Questions | 52 |
| Annex III: Bibliography..... | 54 |
| Annex IV: List of people interviewed..... | 55 |

List of figures and tables

| | |
|---|----|
| Figure 1. Some progress statistics for KSMNP..... | 6 |
| Figure 2. Theory of Change (TOC model)..... | 16 |
| Figure 3. Evaluation Methodology..... | 17 |
| Figure 4. Public Opinion About Services of Kabul Municipality, December 2018..... | 28 |
| Figure 5. Public Opinion About Selected Services of Kabul Municipality, 2018..... | 29 |
| Figure 6. Public Opinion About Tenure Security..... | 30 |
| Figure 7. KSMNP Targets..... | 33 |
| Figure 8. Status of Property Registration and Number of Gozar Assemblies Established | 34 |
| Figure 9. Public Opinion about Safayi Tax System..... | 35 |
| Figure 10. Public Opinion About Safayi Tax Amount..... | 36 |
| Figure 11. Percent of Respondents Who Paid Safayi Tax in 2018..... | 37 |
| Figure 12. Role of Property Registration for Securing the Property..... | 37 |
| | |
| Table 1. Summary of progress towards expected results..... | 5 |
| Table 2. Summary of Evaluation Findings, January 2019..... | 6 |
| Table 3. List of Reviewed Documents..... | 17 |
| Table 4. Log Frame Indicator Progress Status..... | 23 |
| Table 5. Suggested New Indicators about Log Frame Indicators..... | 26 |
| Table 6. Budget Status of KSMNP by January 2019..... | 27 |
| Table 7. KSMNP Progress Status..... | 34 |

Abbreviations and acronyms

| | |
|------------|---|
| ANDS | Afghanistan National Development Strategy |
| ANPDF | Afghanistan Peace and Development Framework |
| ARAZI | Afghanistan Land Authority |
| CFA | City for All |
| FGDs | Focus Group Discussions |
| IDLG/ GDMA | Independent Directorate of Local Governance/ General Directorate of Afghanistan's Municipal Affairs |
| KIIs | Key Informant Interviews |
| KSMNP | Kabul Strengthening Municipal Nahias Programme |
| OC | Occupancy Certificate |
| SNAP | Strategic Nahia Action Planning |
| MUDA | Ministry of Urban Development Affairs |
| NPP | National Priority Plan |
| UN-Habitat | United Nations Human Settlements Programme |
| USAID | United States Agency for International Development |

Executive Summary

Introduction

This mid-term evaluation for Kabul Strengthening Municipal Nahias Programme (KSMNP) was managed by the United Nations Human Settlements Programme (UN-Habitat) country programme in Afghanistan and conducted by external evaluation consultant, Mr. Hakan Demirbuken in January 2019. Scope of the evaluation includes the time period from the start of the project in January 2016 up to December 2018. As outlined in the Terms of Reference, the main purpose of the mid-term evaluation is to review the project deliverables/outputs made so far against the project target and provide recommendations for the remaining period (up to March 2020) for the programme implementation. In-line with this, project documents were reviewed; interviews were carried out with stakeholders and UN-Habitat relevant staff; survey data collection was conducted with beneficiaries (people living in Kabul City); and field observations were made.

Evaluation Findings

Overall, there are three main expected results of KSMNP. Summary of the evaluation findings against each of the expected results are summarized in table 1 below.

Table 1. Summary of progress towards expected results

| KSMNP Expected Results | Summary of Evaluation Findings |
|---|--|
| R1: Strengthened municipal capacities and systems for urban planning, land management and municipal revenue/finance | KSMNP has already registered over 80% of the properties in Kabul city and Safayi Revenue has already increased. Therefore, it is safe to mention that this expected result is already achieved |
| R2: Improved municipal service delivery and strengthened 'social contract' between citizens and municipal authorities | This is partially achieved. KSMNP already has facilitated a platform/system to strengthen social contact between citizens and municipal authorities through the KSMNP project activities. However, it is not yet clear that Municipal service delivery has improved or not. This need to be measured during the remaining duration of KSMNP |
| R3: Improved enabling environment for urban management and administration, municipal governance, local economic development and service deliver | This is partially achieved. KSMNP is developing a sustainable capacity at local partners for sustainable urban management and administration. However, further activities are pending to enhance the capacity at these organizations. Furthermore, evaluation findings suggests UN-Habitat should launch another phase of KSMNP to ensure local capacity is established to sustain the continuity of the activities launched by KSMNP. |

Table 2 summarizes the findings of the Evaluation. Overall, it is safe to mention that KSMNP achieved important and very visible results within a period of less than two years. However, given that the programme has only 14 months left until completion, it needs to increase the implementation delivery rate of the Nahia and Gozar level projects.

Table 2. Summary of Evaluation Findings, January 2019

| Evaluation Criteria | Assessment |
|-----------------------|---|
| Relevance | KSMNP was aligned with Afghanistan Urban National Priority Programme (U-NPP) and Afghanistan National Peace and Development Framework (ANPDF). |
| Effectiveness | 80% of the properties were registered by the end of December 2018. Out of 20, 10 Nahia Profiles and SNAPs were completed. Safayi tax collection increased 40%. |
| Efficiency | KSMNP touches everybody's life in a positive way in Kabul. Also, it creates a sustainable income for Kabul Municipality to improve its public services. The outcomes of the KSMNP proves that project resources were used very efficiently. |
| Impact | KSMNP has impacts on people's lives in Kabul and also provides capacity building to national stakeholders. However, the impact on beneficiaries is not yet measured. |
| Sustainability | KSMNP established a sustainable Safayi income revenue system for Kabul Municipality through establishing a sustainable mechanism and capacity. However, it needs to launch the next phase of KSMNP to ensure the sustainability of the national stakeholders' capacity. |

Details of the key findings are further elaborated below, including with a figure of some progress statistics for KSMNP.

Relevance

KSMNP is a very important project as it directly touches the lives of the people living in Kabul city. Most importantly, it creates a sustainable system to improve the socio-economic life in Kabul city. Moreover, KSMNP is fully aligned with the Afghanistan National Peace and Development Framework (ANPDF) and Urban National Priority Programme (U-NPP).

Effectiveness

Before KSMNP was initiated, almost 70% of the properties were informal and not paying any Safayi Tax to Kabul Municipality. Therefore, Kabul Municipality did not have enough resources to provide efficient and effective municipality services for Kabul city. This situation has changed with the intervention of UN-Habitat by developing KSMNP, which was fully funded by USAID. KSMNP created a database of the properties and distributed more than 177,000 new Safayi invoices in less than two years. As a result – as reported by Kabul Municipality officers – the amount of Safayi tax collection increased by 40% in 2018. Since the beginning of KSMNP Programme, a total of US\$ 5.49 million Safayi was collected by Kabul Municipality. This would not have been possible without the extremely good cooperation of Kabul Municipality, Ministry of Urban Development and ARAZI. During the evaluation period, it was highly noticeable that all stakeholders placed significant importance on the implementation of KSMNP.

Efficiency

KSMNP used financial and human resources efficiently, as the amount of Safayi tax revenue collection increased around 40% in less than two years. Although there are some concerns regarding the absorption rate of the programme funding (US\$32.9 million), it is fair to say that KSMNP was effectively and efficiently managed.

Impact

Through improving the Safayi tax collection system and providing direct support to the Nahia and Gozar projects, KSMNP has had a direct impact on people's lives in Kabul city. Furthermore, KSMNP hit most of the targets listed in the project document. In addition to this, KSMNP has already managed to make a difference in terms of improving the tenure security and increasing the safayi tax amount. However, progress in terms of supporting sub-projects in Nahias and Gozars is not at the desired level. There is, however, still time to make improvements to this component of the programme. One of the important findings of this evaluation is that the KSMNP public awareness campaign worked well and as a result, almost 86% of people are aware of the property registration process. In addition to this, KSMNP managed to establish 464 Gozar Assemblies and has already over-achieved against the target. Furthermore, KSMNP developed a Strategic Nahia Action Plan (SNAP) for 10 out of 20 Nahias. In addition, KSMNP has used 43% of the available funding and has a maximum of 14 months left to use the remaining funding.

Sustainability

预览已结束，完整报告链接和二维码如下：

https://www.yunbaogao.cn/report/index/report?reportId=5_19451

