



Non-State Education in South Asia

Understanding the effect of non-state actors on the quality, equity and safety of education service delivery

Artur Borkowski, Bindu Sunny and Juliana Zapata

December 2021

UNICEF OFFICE OF RESEARCH – INNOCENTI

The Office of Research – Innocenti is UNICEF's dedicated research centre. It undertakes research on emerging or current issues in order to inform the strategic direction, policies and programmes of UNICEF and its partners, shape global debates on child rights and development, and inform the global research and policy agenda for all children, and particularly for the most vulnerable.

Office of Research – Innocenti publications are contributions to a global debate on children and may not necessarily reflect UNICEF policies or approaches.

The Office of Research – Innocenti receives financial support from the Government of Italy, while funding for specific projects is also provided by other governments, international institutions and private sources, including UNICEF National Committees.

The authors prepared this report under the supervision of Thomas Dreesen, Education Manager, Office of Research – Innocenti, and Mathieu Brossard, Chief Education, Office of Research – Innocenti. The findings, interpretations and conclusions expressed in this paper are those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect the views of UNICEF.

This paper has been peer reviewed both externally and within UNICEF. The authors would like to express their gratitude for the excellent inputs provided by the following experts who served as reviewers:

Tariq Ahsan, Professor, Institute of Education and Research (IER), University of Dhaka; Samir Nath, Programme Head, Educational Research Unit, Institute of Educational Development, BRAC; Ivan Coursac, Education Specialist, UNICEF Regional Office for South Asia; Anindita Nugroho, Education Consultant, UNICEF Office of Research – Innocenti.

No potential conflict of interest was reported by the authors or by the reviewers.

Any part of this publication may be freely reproduced if accompanied by the following citation: Artur Borkowski, Bindu Sunny and Juliana Zapata, *Non-State Education in South Asia: Understanding the effect of non-state actors on the quality, equity and safety of education service delivery*, UNICEF Office of Research – Innocenti, Florence, 2021.

Extracts from this publication may be freely reproduced with due acknowledgement. Requests to utilize larger portions or the full publication should be addressed to the Communications Unit at: florence@unicef.org.

Correspondence should be addressed to:
UNICEF Office of Research – Innocenti
Via degli Alfani, 58 | 50121 Florence, Italy
Tel: (+39) 055 20 330 | Fax: (+39) 055 2033 220
florence@unicef.org
www.unicef-irc.org
[@UNICEFINnocenti](https://twitter.com/UNICEFINnocenti)
facebook.com/UnicefInnocenti

© United Nations Children's Fund (UNICEF), 2021

Cover photo © Shaiful Karim/Dhaka Ahsania Mission (February 2020)

Non-State Education in South Asia

Understanding the effect of non-state actors on the quality, equity and safety of education service delivery

Artur Borkowski, Bindu Sunny and Juliana Zapata

CONTENTS

FOREWORD	7
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS.....	8
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	9
KEY FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS	11
CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION.....	16
1.1 Non-state actor involvement in education in South Asia	16
1.2 Conceptual framework	23
1.3 Research objectives and methodology	24
CHAPTER 2: A WHOLE-SYSTEM PERSPECTIVE.....	26
2.1 Introduction.....	26
2.2 Governance	28
2.3 Funding	31
2.4 Accountability	38
2.5 Data systems.....	40
2.6 Priorities for action	42
CHAPTER 3: QUALITY.....	44
3.1 Introduction.....	44
3.2 Learning outcomes	46
3.3 Quality of teaching.....	51
3.4 Leadership and management	59
3.5 School facilities and learning environments.....	61
3.6 School improvement, accountability and choice	63
3.7 Priorities for action	64
CHAPTER 4: EQUITY	66
4.1 Introduction.....	66
4.2 Location-based inequities	68

4.3 Socio-economic disparities.....	70
4.4 Gender inequities	74
4.5 Inequities among disadvantaged groups.....	76
4.6 Access inequities for children with disabilities	77
4.7 Overlapping inequities	78
4.8 Priorities for action	81
CHAPTER 5: SAFETY.....	82
5.1 Introduction.....	82
5.2 Violence in schools	83
5.3 Safety in school.....	89
5.4 Conflicts, natural disasters and emergencies	95
5.5 Priorities for action	97
CHAPTER 6: PRIVATE TUTORING.....	99
6.1 Introduction.....	99
6.2 Determinants of private tutoring	100
6.3 Accountability and regulation.....	103
6.4 Effects of private tutoring on outcomes and education systems	104
6.5 Priorities for action	110
ANNEXES	112
ANNEX 1: COUNTRY PROFILES AND RESEARCH METHODOLOGY	112
Appendix 1 to Annex 1: Country profiles.....	113
Appendix 2 to Annex 1: Role of religious institutions in education provision	138
Appendix 3 to Annex 1: Conceptual framework: supporting table	140
Appendix 4 to Annex 1: Literature review methodology	141
Appendix 5 to Annex 1: Field visits and interviews	145
ANNEX 2: WHOLE-SYSTEM CONSIDERATIONS	146
Appendix 1 to Annex 2: Governance and regulation in the South Asia region.....	147

Appendix 2 to Annex 2: Benefit incidence analysis for South Asia.....	150
Appendix 3 to Annex 2: Data sources used	153
ANNEX 3: QUALITY CONSIDERATIONS	176
Appendix 1 to Annex 3: Meta-analysis	177
Appendix 2 to Annex 3: Quality regulations in India.....	181
ANNEX 4: EQUITY CONSIDERATIONS.....	184
Appendix 1 to Annex 4: Fee regulations, by country.....	185
Appendix 2 to Annex 4: Fee regulations, by state in India.....	188
ANNEX 5: PRIVATE TUTORING	194
Appendix 1 to Annex 5: Regulations on private tutoring, by country.....	195
REFERENCES FOR CHAPTER 1.....	197
REFERENCES FOR CHAPTER 2.....	201
REFERENCES FOR CHAPTER 3.....	211
REFERENCES FOR CHAPTER 4.....	220
REFERENCES FOR CHAPTER 5.....	227
REFERENCES FOR CHAPTER 6.....	231
ENDNOTES	237

FOREWORD

Across the globe, non-state actors are playing an increasing role in shaping education service delivery. The private sector, international agencies, local, national and international non-governmental organizations and communities are all supporting, guiding and/or implementing education service delivery for children and young people. However, this growth has not been supported by sufficient evidence to ensure that all children and, importantly, the most vulnerable, are receiving a good-quality, equitable and safe education through non-state actor engagement in education.

The eight countries in South Asia – Afghanistan, Bangladesh, Bhutan, India, Maldives, Nepal, Pakistan and Sri Lanka – have the largest share of private education (32 per cent) of any region globally. Given the comparatively low levels of investment in education in the region and the need to ensure all children have access to education, the growth of non-state actor engagement in education delivery has supported these countries' efforts towards achieving Sustainable Development Goal 4 (SDG 4) for inclusive, equitable and good-quality education. This growth has raised concerns about whether these types of schools can provide both good-quality and equitable outcomes. The quality of private schools is ambiguous, and the cost of private schooling across countries can put the most vulnerable families searching for equality of opportunity at an even higher risk as they strive to give their children a good education. The limited evidence and data on the safety of children in these settings is remarkable.

As countries continue efforts toward meeting SDG 4 by 2030, many will continue to seek partnerships with non-state actors to fill the current gaps in education provision at all levels. Countries and education stakeholders, such as UNICEF, will need evidence on how best to engage the sector and ensure that both government and non-state schools are delivering good-quality education, and are being held accountable for improving access and learning for all. Ultimately, governments working to secure every child's right to a good-quality, equitable and safe education will need strong frameworks that can guide and support delivery for all.

This research provides insights on the current evidence on non-state actor engagement in education service delivery, and highlights the extent to which non-state actors are part of different types of education provision in South Asia. It is hoped that the findings will inform governments on what the role of non-state actors in education delivery can be, and help to ensure that they are held to the same standards as state schools.



Gunilla Olsson
Director, UNICEF Office of Research – Innocenti



George Laryea-Adjei
Regional Director, UNICEF South Asia

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This report was written by Artur Borkowski, Bindu Sunny and Juliana Zapata.

This project was initiated and conceptualized in close consultation with UNICEF Regional Office for South Asia (UNICEF-ROSA). Bindu Sunny and Juliana Zapata coordinated the work, and Artur Borkowski conducted background research throughout and led the finalization of the report with Radhika Nagesh. Valeria Rocha, Farwa Amjad and Prakhar Sharma supported the team with background research. The project was guided and supervised by Dominic Richardson (Chief, Social and Economic Policy at UNICEF Office of Research – Innocenti) during the initial stages, and by Matt Brossard (Chief of Education at UNICEF Office of Research – Innocenti) and Thomas Dreesen (Education Manager at UNICEF Office of Research – Innocenti) from July 2019 onwards. Claire Akehurst, Amparo Barrera and Lara Stefanizzi offered invaluable administrative support to the team.

The research team would like to acknowledge the guidance of Gunilla Olsson (Director, UNICEF Office of Research – Innocenti), Priscilla Idele (Deputy Director, UNICEF Office of Research – Innocenti) and the many UNICEF colleagues who assisted in the planning, fieldwork and drafting processes. Invaluable editorial and communications support was provided by Sarah Marchant, Celine Little, Dali Mwagore and Dale Rutstein.

The team is indebted to colleagues from UNICEF-ROSA, in particular Sanaullah Panezai (Education Specialist) and Urmila Sarkar (Regional Education Adviser) for the guidance they provided at the start of the project up to 2019, and to Frank Van Cappelle (Education Specialist), Ivan Coursac (Education Specialist) and Jim Ackers (Regional Education Adviser) for their fruitful feedback and guidance from 2019 onwards.

Special thanks go to the many colleagues in UNICEF Country Offices who took time from their busy schedules and liaised with national governments and key stakeholders to facilitate country field visits, data access and evidence generation, as well as for their insightful comments on drafts of the report. This includes the Education Chiefs and their colleagues at UNICEF Afghanistan (Khatera Afghan, Sonia Sukdeo, Lailoma Hassani), UNICEF Bangladesh (Nor Shirin MD Mokhtar, Md Qausar Hossain, Iqbal Hossain, Mohammad Mohsin, Kenneth Russell, Pawan Kucita), UNICEF Bhutan (Bishnu Bhakta Mishra, Natalia Mufel), UNICEF India (Terry Durnnian, Ramachandra Rao Begur, Ganesh Kumar Nigam), and the field offices of Uttar Pradesh (Ritwik Patra) and Maharashtra (Reshma Agarwal, Maithili Gupte), UNICEF Maldives (Mazeena Jameel), UNICEF Nepal (Jimmy Oostrum), UNICEF Pakistan (Claudio Alberti, Ellen

预览已结束，完整报告链接和二维码如下：

https://www.yunbaogao.cn/report/index/report?reportId=5_5865

