

Working Paper 2015-3

Examining the Catalytic Effect of Aid on Domestic Resource Mobilization for Social Transfers in Low-Income Countries

Cécile Cherrier

prepared for the UNRISD project on Politics of Domestic Resource Mobilization

February 2015



The United Nations Research Institute for Social Development (UNRISD) is an autonomous research institute within the UN system that undertakes multidisciplinary research and policy analysis on the social dimensions of contemporary development issues. Through our work we aim to ensure that social equity, inclusion and justice are central to development thinking, policy and practice.

UNRISD, Palais des Nations 1211 Geneva 10, Switzerland

Tel: +41 (0)22 9173020 Fax: +41 (0)22 9170650 info@unrisd.org www.unrisd.org

Copyright © United Nations Research Institute for Social Development

This is not a formal UNRISD publication. The responsibility for opinions expressed in signed studies rests solely with their author(s), and availability on the UNRISD Web site (www.unrisd.org) does not constitute an endorsement by UNRISD of the opinions expressed in them. No publication or distribution of these papers is permitted without the prior authorization of the author(s), except for personal use.

Introduction to Working Papers on The Politics of Domestic Resource Mobilization for Social Development

This paper is part of a series of outputs from the research project on The Politics of Domestic Resource Mobilization for Social Development.

The project seeks to contribute to global debates on the political and institutional contexts that enable poor countries to mobilize domestic resources for social development. It examines the processes and mechanisms that connect the politics of resource mobilization and demands for social provision; changes in state-citizen and donor-recipient relations associated with resource mobilization and allocation; and governance reforms that can lead to improved and sustainable revenue yields and services. For further information on the project visit www.unrisd.org/pdrm.

This project is funded by SIDA and UNRISD core funds.

Series Editors: Katja Hujo and Harald Braumann

Working Papers on The Politics of Domestic Resource Mobilization for Social Development

Examining the Catalytic Effect of Aid on Domestic Resource Mobilization for Social Transfers in Low-Income Countries
Cécile Cherrier, February 2015.

Tax Bargains: Understanding the Role Played by Public and Private Actors in Influencing Tax Policy Reform in Uganda. Jalia Kangave and Mesharch W. Katusiimeh, February 2015.

State-Business Relations and the Financing of the Welfare State in Argentina and Chile: Challenges and Prospects.

Jamee K. Moudud, Esteban Perez Caldentey and Enrique Delamonica, December 2014.

From Consensus to Contention: Changing Revenue and Policy Dynamics in Uganda. Anne Mette Kjær and Marianne S. Ulriksen, December 2014.

Fiscal Capacity and Aid Allocation: Domestic Resource Mobilization and Foreign Aid in Developing Countries.

Aniket Bhushan and Yiagadeesen Samy, May 2014.

The History of Resource Mobilization and Social Spending in Uganda. Marianne S. Ulriksen and Mesharch W. Katusiimeh, March 2014

Extractive Industries, Revenue Allocation and Local Politics. Javier Arellano and Andrés Mejía Acosta. March 2014.

Obstacles to Increasing Tax Revenues in Low-Income Countries.

Mick Moore, November 2013. UNRISD-ICTD Working Paper No. 15, UNRISD, International Centre for Tax and Development.

Contents

Acronyms		ii
Abstract		iii
	on	
Hypothesi	zing the Effect of Aid in Policy Uptake	3
Aid as a	a Triggering Factor in Adopting a Social Transfer Scheme	3
Likeliho	ood for Aid to Bring about Sustainable Policy Change	4
Limits of	of a Linear Evidence-based Approach to Policymaking	6
Methods f	or Exploring the Origins of Social Transfers	7
Empirical	Evidence From Six African Cases	11
Trigger	ing Factors in the Emergence of the Schemes	11
Social,	Political and Financial Sustainability of the Schemes	13
Role of	Evidence in Policymaking	15
Discussing	g Findings from the Empirical Case Studies	21
Citizen-	State Relations	21
Rights-	Based Approach	22
Transfo	rmative Agenda	23
Conclusio	ns	24
Reference	S	27
Boxes Box 1. Dis	fferent Aid Strategies to Support the Use of Social Transfers	17
Figures Figure 1.	Analytical Framework of the Determinants of a Social Transfer Policy	8
Figure 2.	Using the Framework for Within-Case Phase-Specific Analysis	10
Tables		2
Table 1. Table 3.	A First Approach to Assessing the Level of National Ownership Tentative Typology of Origin Stories of Social Transfer Schemes	12
Table 4.	Overview of Selected Social Transfer Schemes in Sub-Saharan Africa	18

Acronyms

CT-OVC Kenya's Cash Transfers for Orphans and Vulnerable Children
DFID United Kingdom's Department for International Development

GDP Gross Domestic Product

GTZ Deutsche Gesellschaft für Technische Zusammenarbeit (German Agency for Technical

Cooperation)

HIPC Heavily Indebted Poor Countries

HIV/AIDS Human immunodeficiency virus infection/acquired immunodeficiency syndrome

IFI International Financial Institution

LEAP Ghana's Livelihoods Empowerment Against Poverty

MMYE Ghana's Ministry of Manpower, Youth and Employment

MP Member of Parliament

NGO Non-governmental organization

OAP Old Age Pension

OECD Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development

OVC Orphans and other Vulnerable Children
PRSP Poverty Reduction Strategy Papers

PSNP Ethiopia's Productive Safety Net Programme

PSSB Mozambique's Programa de Subsídio Social Básico (Basic Social Subsidy Programme)

SACU Southern African Customs Union

SCT Social Cash Transfer

UNAIDS Joint United Nations Programme on HIV/AIDS

UNICEF United Nations Children's Fund

UNRISD United Nations Research Institute for Social Development
USAID United States Agency for International Development

Abstract

Social transfers, a non-contributory form of social protection, present a great potential to tackle poverty and inequality, and support inclusive socioeconomic development. Yet, they also represent a long-term financial commitment, and in environments where they are most needed, national policymakers are often reluctant to introduce them. In reaction to this situation, foreign aid actors have been allocating resources to support the expansion of social transfers in low-income countries. Progress in terms of policy uptake has been slow, and there has been concern over the ability of aid initiatives around social transfers to translate into sustainable policy changes and contribute to more inclusive development patterns. Better understanding why governments come to adopt and finance certain types of social transfers—and what role, if any, foreign aid actors play—can usefully inform the formulation of strategies towards the expansion of basic social protection in countries where the process appears to have stalled. This paper is part of the UNRISD research project on 'The Politics of Domestic Resource Mobilization for Social Development'. Its specific contribution is with regards to the catalytic effect of foreign aid on domestic resource mobilization for social transfers in low-income countries. The paper elaborates on a comparative analysis of the origins and features of six sizable social transfer schemes currently operating in low-income African countries. Findings suggest a catalytic effect of aid on mobilizing additional domestic resources for social transfers. But in light of these findings, the paper questions whether, at least in some cases, a narrow focus on social transfer instruments may have distracted public resources (domestic and foreign) away from deeper causes of poverty and marginalization, doing a disservice to the transformative agenda development partners claim to defend.

Author

Cécile Cherrier is an independent consultant in social protection and a PhD candidate at the Maastricht Graduate School of Governance/UNU-MERIT.



https://www.yunbaogao.cn/report/index/report?reportId=5_20839

