



The Migration-Social Policy Nexus: Current and Future Research

Jane Pillinger

May 2008

prepared for the UNRISD – IOM – IFS project on
Social Policy and Migration in Developing Countries

DRAFT WORKING DOCUMENT

Do not cite without the author's approval



The **United Nations Research Institute for Social Development (UNRISD)** is an autonomous agency engaging in multidisciplinary research on the social dimensions of contemporary problems affecting development. Its work is guided by the conviction that, for effective development policies to be formulated, an understanding of the social and political context is crucial. The Institute attempts to provide governments, development agencies, grassroots organizations and scholars with a better understanding of how development policies and processes of economic, social and environmental change affect different social groups. Working through an extensive network of national research centres, UNRISD aims to promote original research and strengthen research capacity in developing countries.

Research programmes include: Civil Society and Social Movements; Democracy, Governance and Well-Being; Gender and Development; Identities, Conflict and Cohesion; Markets, Business and Regulation; and Social Policy and Development.

A list of the Institute's free and priced publications can be obtained by contacting the Reference Centre.

UNRISD, Palais des Nations
1211 Geneva 10, Switzerland

Tel: (41 22) 9173020
Fax: (41 22) 9170650
E-mail: info@unrisd.org
Web: <http://www.unrisd.org>

Copyright © United Nations Research Institute for Social Development (UNRISD).

This is not a formal UNRISD publication. The responsibility for opinions expressed in signed studies rests solely with their author(s), and availability on the UNRISD Web site (<http://www.unrisd.org>) does not constitute an endorsement by UNRISD of the opinions expressed in them. No publication or distribution of these papers is permitted without the prior authorization of the author(s), except for personal use.

1. Introduction

This paper discusses the migration-social policy nexus by showing that there are important connections between migration and transformations in social policy. This paper develops an analytical framework for the integration of social policy and migration policy. It examines the relevance of emerging ideas on the migration-social policy nexus and transnational social policy, particularly within a South-South context. Central to the migration-social policy nexus is that it reconceptualises social policy and places it outside of the framework of the nation state and in particular locates it in the context of cross-border migration. This framework provides insights into how migration affects national and transnational social welfare systems, transnational networks and service provisioning in developed countries, and how global social policy connects with socially focussed migration policy. It considers how such linkages vary in the context of different migration patterns, and in the context of South-North and South-South migration.

The paper suggests that better linkages in policy and research between migration policy and social policy are needed in order to address impact of international migration on welfare systems. This is intended to contribute to analytical and development activities that link migration to welfare, including measures to address poverty, inequality, the provision of health, education and other services, and the related issues of human capital. The migration-social policy nexus is discussed in relation to transformations in social policy in countries of origin and destination, with reference to migrant diasporas and remittances, the connections between migration regimes, gender equality and care systems, and the social institutions and the inter-relationships that influence how global, regional or national governance and political processes can integrate migration policy and social policy. In so doing it examines analytical frameworks in areas such as remittances, the brain drain and the global care chain for their relevance to social policy. While much of the research in the area of remittances and brain drain are relevant to social policy, there are other important areas that are under-researched concerning the impact of migration on service provisioning, access to social rights and social protection, and the evolution of welfare systems in developing countries. By reviewing theoretical and empirical research on migration policy, social policy and social development, the paper identifies the need for an analytical and multidisciplinary approach to research in this area.

In recent years international migration¹ has become an issue of significant political and research interest.² The growth and scale of international migration means that in the future the migration-social policy nexus will be important to how both migration and social policy are managed nationally and internationally. International migration has resulted in opportunities for social and economic development, for governments,

¹ In addition to mobile and temporary residents of other countries, there are 176 million people who are permanent residents outside of their country of origin, representing around two per cent of the global population. An estimated further 15-30 million undocumented or “illegal” migrants internationally (ILO 2004).

² Global Commission on International Migration 2005; UN 2006; IOM 2005b; ILO 2004

communities and migrants in developing countries. To date, the main focus of policy and research has been on the social policy implications of migration in countries of destination in the North regarding the integration of migrants in destination countries, and to a lesser extent the adaptation to and impact of migration policy regimes on Western welfare systems. This has been to the neglect of social policy analysis of the implications of migration for the welfare systems of developing countries and for South-South migration, where the bulk of international migration takes place. There are significant flows of migration in a South-South context, whereby nearly one half of all international migration and a majority of migration between neighbouring countries takes place (Ratha and Shaw 2007).

2. What is social policy?

Social policy contributes to the welfare of society as a whole and in a broad sense includes redistribution, production, reproduction and protection. It concerns the collective provision, financing and delivery of services that contribute to the welfare of individuals, groups and families, which result in transformations in social welfare at a societal level. In practice social policies are closely connected to economic policy, the outcomes of which can have direct or indirect social impacts. Welfare systems in developed and developing countries are increasingly shaped by a dominant discourse that stresses the importance of the “productivist” welfare model, active labour market policies and the contribution to funding social protection through work. They have been important to European Union policies as well as those of international organizations and can be seen in the concepts used to describe developmental social policy regimes in some developing countries, for example, South Africa.

In the main social policy goals include government provision, and/or regulation, of social welfare in areas such as education, social security, health and social care, and the labour market. Social policies exist at the national and international levels in order to transform welfare, meet basic human needs, improve livelihoods, to accord social justice and human rights, to facilitate the inclusion and integration of diverse population groups, and to create the optimum level of societal cohesion and economic development. In this sense it is defined by the way that it can mediate well-being, equality, participation, inclusion and autonomy in society. For instance, although many of the indicators concerning development address income inequalities, it is relevant to examine the extent to which social policy can mediate well being, autonomy and human capabilities, rather than just how they contribute to material well-being (Sen 1999; Gough 2000).

In a development context Mkandawire (2001) defines social policy as being collective interventions designed to transform social welfare, social institutions and social relations. Transformations in social welfare encompass access to adequate income and welfare provisions that provide social protection and maintain livelihoods and well-being. This can include the provision of services such as health and social care, education, housing and water; while income maintenance provisions can cover minimum incomes, social security and pensions. Social policies can impact positively or negatively on social relations in areas such as class, race, ethnicity and gender, and in turn on inequalities

between groups in their access to resources, recognition and participation. Social institutions are also an important aspect of social policy, since the capacity of the State is central to the delivery of welfare and in connecting economic and social development. While there are significant differences in social policy regimes between developed and developing countries, social policy in developing countries has been largely residual.

As Mkandawire argues it is necessary to remove this residual role: “Social policy should be conceived as involving overall and prior concerns with social development that works in tandem with economic policy to ensure equitable and socially sustainable development” (2001:1). He argues that political and societal variables and institutions that shape social policy have different “policy implications of different political, economic and social settings” (2001:24). Part of this argument is related to the role played by social policy in poverty reduction programmes and of the intrinsic importance of social policy to both social and economic development. The developmental role of social policy can be seen in the beneficial impact that investments in social expenditure in areas such as health and education have on human development with regard to life expectancies, livelihoods and economic growth, while social policy can also have important income redistribution and equity outcomes. Similarly global human rights discourses have situated social rights within a development context with an emphasis on the role of the State in recognizing human rights. At the same time, the role of social security is recognized as being important in providing stability, cohesion and economic security.

There are significant conceptual differences and research focus in the social policy literature from developed and developing countries. Social policy has remained marginal in many developing countries, where the remit is often narrowly focussed on poverty reduction and residualism. Social policy can play an important transformative and instrumental role in development, with evidence that universalistic models of service provision have been important to poverty reduction in some countries (Mkandawire 2005). While the social and economic contexts vary hugely, social policy insights, particularly concerning welfare regimes, from developed countries can provide useful analytical understandings that can help to inform social policies in developing countries.³

3. The migration-social policy nexus

The migration-social policy nexus defines the relationship between migration and social development and social policy. It has the potential to provide a focus to the role of migration on social welfare systems in developing countries, to how social policies respond to migration and to how social welfare systems are transformed through migration, in areas such as social development, care regimes, social protection and redistribution. Putting a lens on the migration-social policy nexus raises three important questions. What are the implications for the development of social welfare systems of South-South migration on both countries of origin and destination and what is the impact of migration policies on social welfare systems in these countries? How far will welfare

³ Mkandawire 2001; Gough 2000; Kuhnle and Hort 2004

systems be dependent on immigrant labour in the future and if so how will this be managed so that migration policies of countries of destination can enhance the benefits of migration, and in turn impact on social policy and social development in the South? To what extent are the new patterns of international migration impacting on the demand for welfare services in the North and the South?

The limited connection between migration policy and social policy means that the issues are treated as separate policy domains; the impact and contribution of migration on the welfare and well-being of migrants can, as a result, be under-played in both developed and developing countries. As a result the migration-social policy nexus raises important questions about the way in which government policies can be structured to take account of migration and the structuring and shaping of welfare systems, and to how welfare systems adapt to and are affected by international migration and globalization.

The emergence of a transnational approach to social policy and an interest in the social impacts of migration policy highlights the need for analytical frameworks to improve the coordination and understanding of global social policy connections, on the one hand, and socially focussed migration policy, on the other hand. As Mkandawire (2001) argues the outcome and nature of social policies, and the institutions that are developed in tandem, are highly dependent on the relationship to the political contexts in which they are situated, the relationship between economic and social policies, and between macroeconomic and social policy: “One implication is that social policy must be designed not only residually, to cater for social needs, but as a key component of policies that ensure the wherewithal for their own sustainability” (2001:23).

While the social and development implications of international migration have received less attention than economic issues, social policy and social development issues are increasingly being discussed in the context of the migration-development nexus (Global Commission on International Migration 2005; Van Hear and Nyberg Sørensen 2003). However, this is to a lesser extent in the context of social relations and transformations in social welfare systems within the migration-social policy nexus. The conceptualization of the migration-social policy nexus builds on the framework for migration and development that has been elaborated in the migration-development nexus, which highlights social development, the development potential of migrants and the coordination between migration and development aid regimes (Levitt and Nyberg Sørensen 2004). Adding a social policy dimension to this nexus provides a rich understanding of the implications for social welfare systems in those countries affected by migration and improving the linkages between international migration and transnational social policy. As a result the migration-social policy nexus is an important area for future policy coordination in order to integrate social policy and migration policy domains, since as Papademetriou (2003) argues this policy coordination is crucial to “mainstreaming” immigration decisions across different across different policy areas such as social welfare, education and training, and foreign and development policy and so on.

As mentioned above most research in the field of migration policy and social policy has tended to focus on the consequences of migration on receiving countries, rather than countries of transit or origin (de Haas 2005a, 2005b). We know little of the contribution of migration to the welfare and wellbeing of international migrants. The theory that either poverty or overpopulation causes migration is widely seen as an oversimplification and as O'Neil argues, "people move for a variety of reasons, and their movements are facilitated by complex and enduring transnational social networks"(2003:12). Consequently there are a wide diversity of migration experiences in the areas of pre-departure, transition and post-arrival.

That said an understanding of migrants' transnational practices raises a number of policy questions and the need for a conceptual approach embedded in the migration-social policy nexus. There is a general consensus in the literature on transnational migration about the positive effects of migration on the economic and social development of countries of origin.⁴ However, less is known about the impact of refugee migration on social development and of poverty on refugee cross-border movements, forced labour or trafficking. Similarly, relatively little is known about South-South migration and the maintenance of transnational social networks that can impact on social development and social welfare systems. As Nyberg, Sørensen, Van Hear and Engberg-Pedersen argue:

Migration and development are linked in many ways – through the livelihood and survival strategies of individuals, households and communities; through large and often well-targeted remittances; through investments and advocacy by diasporas and transnational communities; and through international mobility associated with global integration, inequality and insecurity (2003: 267).

However, the links between poverty reduction and international migration are uncertain and are described as “unsettled” (Papademetriou and Martin 1991). As Sørensen, Van Hear and Engberg-Pederson's (2003) review of literature in this area shows migration has always been about economic and social development, although in recent years displacement of populations within and across borders, and the related growth of refugees fleeing war or conflict, has impacted on the capacity and impact of development policy. The relationship between migration and poverty reduction is therefore highly complex and Sørensen, Van Hear and Engberg-Pederson conclude that: “There is no direct link between poverty, economic development, population growth, social and political change on the one hand and international immigration on the other. Poverty reduction is not in itself a migration-reducing strategy” (2003:5). Nevertheless, poverty reduction and development can enhance people's opportunities and possibilities to migrate, particularly as migration can incur significant economic resources and costs. Although it is known that a lack of local development options can impact on economic migration, there has been limited research on external factors such as structural adjustment policies on welfare, well-being and access to resources, and the extent to which these impact on decisions to migrate.

⁴ IOM 2004, 2005b; Levitt and Nyberg Sørensen 2004; Global Commission on International Migration 2005

One allied development has been the way in which international human rights can be optimized and realized in relation to the social development potential of international migration. While the Global Commission on International Migration (2005) addressed these issues in its remit, only in passing did it address the connections between migration and social development and social policy in a systematic way. Key areas are the implications of international migration on health, the interrelationship between migration and the achievement of the Millennium Development Goals, and the vulnerabilities faced by different groups of migrants, including women and children. Translating these goals into government programmes and policies that impact on the long-term development of welfare systems remains an important challenge.

3. The connections between global social policy and international migration

The development of a global or transnational approach to social policy is central to how welfare systems respond to and deal with international migration in a South-North and South-South context. Emerging ideas on global and transnational social policy highlight the impact of globalization on social welfare and social inequalities, the need for global institutions to respond to the growth of economic globalization and the way that social policies can operate in a global context in the areas of social regulation, social rights and social redistribution Deacon and Yeates (2006).

Although in recent years there has been a growth of research interest in global social policy and comparative social policy, it has largely not been focussed on migration decisions and migration policy issues. Where migration has been linked to social policy this had tended towards a lens on how Western states are coping with or responding to migration in different contexts, for example, in the development of integration policies (Jones-Finer 2006). Research on comparative social policy and welfare regimes has also been focussed on European and developed countries, and to a lesser extent on developing countries (Alcock and Craig 2001; Esping-Andersen 1990, 1996). Nevertheless, the attention to global social policy issues in the social policy literature has grown considerably in recent years.⁵ In this context global social policy has linked national to regional, international and transnational perspectives in social policy (Deacon 2003, 2007; Yeates and Deacon 2006), in providing a new framework for understanding welfare regimes in a global and development context (Hill and May 2006; Gough et al. 2004), in advocating for social policy as a key element of economic development,

预览已结束，完整报告链接和二维码如下：

https://www.yunbaogao.cn/report/index/report?reportId=5_21165

