

Determining discriminating concentrations of insecticides for monitoring resistance in mosquitoes

Report of a multi-centre laboratory study
and WHO expert consultations



**World Health
Organization**

Determining discriminating concentrations of insecticides for monitoring resistance in mosquitoes

**Report of a multi-centre laboratory study
and WHO expert consultations**



**World Health
Organization**

Determining discriminating concentrations of insecticides for monitoring resistance in mosquitoes: report of a multi-centre laboratory study and WHO expert consultations

ISBN 978-92-4-004520-0 (electronic version)

ISBN 978-92-4-004521-7 (print version)

© World Health Organization 2022

Some rights reserved. This work is available under the Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 IGO licence (CC BY-NC-SA 3.0 IGO; <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-sa/3.0/igo>).

Under the terms of this licence, you may copy, redistribute and adapt the work for non-commercial purposes, provided the work is appropriately cited, as indicated below. In any use of this work, there should be no suggestion that WHO endorses any specific organization, products or services. The use of the WHO logo is not permitted. If you adapt the work, then you must license your work under the same or equivalent Creative Commons licence. If you create a translation of this work, you should add the following disclaimer along with the suggested citation: "This translation was not created by the World Health Organization (WHO). WHO is not responsible for the content or accuracy of this translation. The original English edition shall be the binding and authentic edition".

Any mediation relating to disputes arising under the licence shall be conducted in accordance with the mediation rules of the World Intellectual Property Organization (<http://www.wipo.int/amc/en/mediation/rules/>).

Suggested citation. Determining discriminating concentrations of insecticides for monitoring resistance in mosquitoes: report of a multi-centre laboratory study and WHO expert consultations. Geneva: World Health Organization; 2022. Licence: [CC BY-NC-SA 3.0 IGO](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-sa/3.0/igo).

Cataloguing-in-Publication (CIP) data. CIP data are available at <http://apps.who.int/iris>.

Sales, rights and licensing. To purchase WHO publications, see <http://apps.who.int/bookorders>. To submit requests for commercial use and queries on rights and licensing, see <https://www.who.int/copyright>.

Third-party materials. If you wish to reuse material from this work that is attributed to a third party, such as tables, figures or images, it is your responsibility to determine whether permission is needed for that reuse and to obtain permission from the copyright holder. The risk of claims resulting from infringement of any third-party-owned component in the work rests solely with the user.

General disclaimers. The designations employed and the presentation of the material in this publication do not imply the expression of any opinion whatsoever on the part of WHO concerning the legal status of any country, territory, city or area or of its authorities, or concerning the delimitation of its frontiers or boundaries. Dotted and dashed lines on maps represent approximate border lines for which there may not yet be full agreement.

The mention of specific companies or of certain manufacturers' products does not imply that they are endorsed or recommended by WHO in preference to others of a similar nature that are not mentioned. Errors and omissions excepted, the names of proprietary products are distinguished by initial capital letters.

All reasonable precautions have been taken by WHO to verify the information contained in this publication. However, the published material is being distributed without warranty of any kind, either expressed or implied. The responsibility for the interpretation and use of the material lies with the reader. In no event shall WHO be liable for damages arising from its use.

This report contains the views of an international group of experts and does not necessarily represent the decisions or the stated policy of the World Health Organization.

Contents

Acknowledgements	v
Abbreviations and acronyms	vii
Key outcomes	ix
Recommendations made to WHO	x
1 Introduction	1
2 Objectives of the study	4
3 Participating laboratories	5
3.1 Lead coordinating institution	5
3.2 Collaborators	5
4 Test compounds	7
5 Mosquito species	10
6 General framework of the study	11
6.1 Development of bottle bioassay method for group B compounds	13
6.1.1 Method development	13
6.1.2 Cross-validation of bottle bioassay method	13
6.2 Multi-centre testing of serial concentrations of test compounds (groups A and B) to establish concentration–response curves (steps 1 and 2)	14
6.3 Multi-centre validation of tentative discriminating concentrations against various mosquito species (step 3)	17
6.4 Data analysis and reporting	19
6.4.1 Data analysis, validation and interpretation	19
6.4.2 Data reporting and monitoring of progress	20
7 Results	21
7.1 WHO tube tests	21
7.1.1 Test completion rates	21
7.1.2 Concentration–response curves and estimated LC ₉₉ and LC ₁₀₀	22
7.1.3 Validation of tentative discriminating concentrations in filter paper tests (step 3)	39
7.1.4 Main constraints encountered	42

7.2	WHO bottle bioassays	43
7.2.1	Development and validation of the WHO bottle bioassay protocol	43
7.2.2	Bioassay completion rates	55
7.2.3	Concentration–response curves and estimate of LC_{99} and LC_{100}	57
7.2.4	Validation of tentative discriminating concentrations in step 3 for WHO bottle bioassays	76
7.2.5	Main constraints encountered	81
8	Conclusions	83
8.1	WHO tube tests	83
8.2	WHO bottle bioassays	84
8.3	Challenges and the way forward	87
8.4	Research priorities for WHO tube tests	89
8.5	Research priorities for WHO bottle bioassays	89
	References	90
	Annex. Participating institutions and mosquito strains available	92

Acknowledgements

The World Health Organization (WHO) Department of Control of Neglected Tropical Diseases thanks the following people who participated in the study and in the WHO consultations to review results, assisted in the data validation and finalized this report.

Study investigators (organized alphabetically by country): Corine Ngufor (Collaborative Research Programme, London School of Hygiene & Tropical Medicine, Cotonou, Benin); Ademir Martins Jr (Fiocruz, Rio de Janeiro, Brazil); Bayili Bazoma (Institut de Recherche en Sciences de la Santé, Bobo-Dioulasso, Burkina Faso); Severin N'Do, Institut de Recherche en Sciences de la Santé, Cameroon; Josiane Etang and Nwane Philippe (Organisation de coordination et de coopération pour la lutte contre les grandes endémies en Afrique Centrale, Yaoundé, Cameroon); Zhao Chunchun, Meng Fengxia, Liu Qiyong (National Institute for Communicable Disease Control and Prevention, Chinese Centre for Disease Control and Prevention, Beijing, China); Martha Liliana Ahumada (Instituto Nacional de Salud, Bogotá, Colombia); Martha Quinones (University of Colombia, Bogotá, Colombia); Raphael N'Guessan (London School of Hygiene & Tropical Medicine, Bouake, Côte d'Ivoire); Laura Andréo, Vincent Corbel, Stephane Duchon, Celine Montazeau (Institut de Recherche pour le Développement, Montpellier, France); Mamadou B. Coulibaly (Malaria Research and Training Centre, Bamako, Mali); Kasinathan Gunasekaran, Ashwani Kumar, Shriram Ananganallur Nagarajan (Indian Council of Medical Research–Vector Control Research Centre, Puducherry, India); Urugayala Sreehari (Indian Council of Medical Research–National Institute of Malaria Research, Bengaluru, India); Kamaraju Raghavendra, Vaishali Verma (Indian Council of Medical Research–National Institute of Malaria Research, New Delhi, India); Hamdan Ahmad, Adanan Che Rus (Vector Control Research Unit, Universiti Sains Malaysia, Penang, Malaysia); Adriana Flores (Universidad Autonoma de Nuevo Leon, Mexico); Jesús A. Pinto Caballero, Miriam Palomino (National Institute of Health, Lima, Peru); Cheon Huat Tan (Wilson), Agnes Koo Sin Ying (Environmental Health Institute, Singapore); Basil Brooke, Michael Samuel (Vector Control Reference Laboratory, National Institute for Communicable Diseases, Johannesburg, South Africa); Pie Müller (Swiss Tropical and Public Health Institute, Basel, Switzerland); Waraporn Juntarajumnong (Kasetsart University of Agriculture, Bangkok, Thailand); Sungsit Sungvornyothin (Mahidol University, Bangkok, Thailand); Rosemary Lees, Giorgio Praulins (Liverpool School of Tropical Medicine, Liverpool, United Kingdom); Mark Rowland (London School of Hygiene & Tropical Medicine, London, United Kingdom); Matt Kirby (Kilimanjaro Christian Medical University College and London School of Hygiene & Tropical Medicine, Moshi, United Republic of Tanzania); Audrey Lenhart (Entomology Branch, Centers for Disease Control and Prevention, Atlanta (GA), United States of America).

Experts who participated in WHO consultations¹: Rajib Chowdhury (National Institute of Preventive and Social Medicine, Bangladesh); Luc Djogbenou (Universite Abomey Calavi,

¹ Experts who participated in the WHO consultations were those who were found to have no declared conflict of interests.

Benin); Ahmad Ali Enayati (Mazamdaran University of Medical Sciences, Islamic Republic of Iran); Eric Ochomo (Co-chair) (Kenya Medical Entomology Research Institute, Kenya); Intan Ishak (Universiti Science Malaysia, Penang, Malaysia); Gissella Vasquez (US Naval Medical Research Unit No. 6, Peru); João Pinto (Chair) (Instituto de Higiene e Medicina Tropical, Lisbon, Portugal); Thomas Churcher (Imperial College, London, United Kingdom); Steve Lindsay (Durham University, Durham, United Kingdom); Matthew Thomas (York Environmental Sustainability Institute, York, United Kingdom).

Other stakeholders¹: Frederic Schmitt (Bayer CropScience, Lyon, France); Achim Reddig, Susanne Stutz (BASF SE, Limburgerhof, Germany); Sebastian Horstmann, Juergen Junkersdorf (Bayer AG Research & Development, CropScience, Monheim, Germany); Vimal Mahalingam, Rajesh Mathew (Tagros Chemicals Co. Ltd, Chennai, India); Yuki Ando, Mai Fukuzawa, Kunizo Mori (Mitsui Chemicals Agro, Inc., Tokyo, Japan); Kate Kolaczinski (Global Fund to Fight AIDS, Tuberculosis and Malaria, Geneva, Switzerland); Mark Hoppe, Clay Scherer (Syngenta, Basel, Switzerland); John Invest, John Lucas (Technical Consultants, Sumitomo Chemical Co. Ltd, London, United Kingdom); Dave Malone (Bill & Melinda Gates Foundation, Liverpool, United Kingdom); Angus Spiers (Innovation-2-Impact Project, Liverpool, United Kingdom); Richard Oxborough (London, United Kingdom); Barnabas Zogo (Sumitomo Chemical Co. Ltd., London, United Kingdom); Jennifer Armistead (President's Malaria Initiative, United States of America); James W. Austin (BASF Corporation, Durham (NC), United States of America); Ben Hamza, Rakim Turnipseed (FMC Corporation, Philadelphia (PA), United States of America); Helen Jamet (Bill & Melinda Gates Foundation, Seattle (WA), United States of America).

WHO regional and country office focal persons: Dr Emmanuel Chanda (Regional Office for Africa, Brazzaville, Congo); Haroldo Sergio da Silva Bezerra (Regional Office for the Americas, Washington (DC), United States of America); Aya Yajima (Regional Office for South-East Asia, New Delhi, India); Elkhan Gasimov (Regional Office for Europe, Copenhagen, Denmark); Dr Samira Al-Eryani (Regional Office for the Eastern Mediterranean, Cairo, Egypt); Amanda Kim Murphy (Country Office, Suva, Fiji); Tessa Knox (Country Office, Port Vila, Vanuatu).

WHO headquarters: Raman Velayudhan, Rajpal S. Yadav (Department of Control of Neglected Tropical Diseases); Jan Kolaczinski. Lucía Fernández Montova. Jennifer Stevenson. Chunzhe

预览已结束，完整报告链接和二维码如下：

https://www.yunbaogao.cn/report/index/report?reportId=5_23278

