



**World Health  
Organization**



# **Indicator framework to evaluate the public health effectiveness of digital proximity tracing solutions**





# **Indicator framework to evaluate the public health effectiveness of digital proximity tracing solutions**

## Indicator framework for the evaluation of the public health effectiveness of digital proximity tracing solutions

### WHO

ISBN 978-92-4-002835-7 (electronic version)  
ISBN 978-92-4-002836-4 (print version)

### ECDC

ISBN 978-92-9498-537-8 (electronic version)  
doi:10.2900/642768  
TQ-02-21-659-EN-N

### © World Health Organization and the European Centre for Disease Prevention and Control 2021

Some rights reserved. This work is available under the Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 IGO licence (CC BY-NC-SA 3.0 IGO; <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-sa/3.0/IGO>).

Under the terms of this licence, you may copy, redistribute and adapt the work for non-commercial purposes, provided the work is appropriately cited, as indicated below. In any use of this work, there should be no suggestion that WHO or ECDC endorse any specific organization, products or services. The use of the WHO or ECDC logo is not permitted. If you adapt the work, then you must license your work under the same or equivalent Creative Commons licence. If you create a translation of this work, you should add the following disclaimer along with the suggested citation: “This translation was not created by the World Health Organization (WHO) or the European Centre for Disease Prevention and Control (ECDC). WHO and ECDC are not responsible for the content or accuracy of this translation. The original English edition shall be the binding and authentic edition”.

Any mediation relating to disputes arising under the licence shall be conducted in accordance with the mediation rules of the World Intellectual Property Organization (<http://www.wipo.int/amc/en/mediation/rules>).

**Suggested citation.** Indicator framework for the evaluation of the public health effectiveness of digital proximity tracing solutions. Geneva: World Health Organization and European Centre for Disease Prevention and Control; 2021. Licence: CC BY-NC-SA 3.0 IGO.

**Cataloguing-in-Publication (CIP) data.** CIP data are available at <http://apps.who.int/iris>.

**Sales, rights and licensing.** To purchase WHO publications, see <http://apps.who.int/bookorders>. To submit requests for commercial use and queries on rights and licensing, see <http://www.who.int/about/licensing>.

**Third-party materials.** If you wish to reuse material from this work that is attributed to a third party, such as tables, figures or images, it is your responsibility to determine whether permission is needed for that reuse and to obtain permission from the copyright holder. The risk of claims resulting from infringement of any third-party-owned component in the work rests solely with the user.

**WHO Photographs.** WHO photographs are copyrighted and are not to be reproduced in any medium without obtaining prior written permission. Requests for permission to

reproduce WHO photographs should be addressed to: [http://www.who.int/about/licensing/copyright\\_form/en/](http://www.who.int/about/licensing/copyright_form/en/)

The designations employed and the presentation of the material in this publication do not imply the expression of any opinion whatsoever on the part of the World Health Organization and ECDC concerning the legal status of any country, territory, city or area or of its authorities, or concerning the delimitation of its frontiers or boundaries. Dotted lines on maps represent approximate border lines for which there may not yet be full agreement.

The mention of specific companies or of certain manufacturers' products does not imply that they are endorsed or recommended by the World Health Organization and ECDC in preference to others of a similar nature that are not mentioned. Errors and omissions excepted, the names of proprietary products are distinguished by initial capital letters.

All reasonable precautions have been taken by the World Health Organization and ECDC to verify the information contained in this publication. However, the published material is being distributed without warranty of any kind, either expressed or implied. The responsibility for the interpretation and use of the material lies with the reader. In no event shall the World Health Organization and ECDC be liable for damages arising from its use.

Cover picture: © Getty Images

# Contents

<b>Key messages</b> .....	v
<b>Executive summary</b> .....	v
<b>1. Introduction</b> .....	1
<b>2. Digital proximity tracing rationale, design, operation and limitations</b> .....	2
<b>3. Introduction to the indicators</b> .....	4
<b>4. Options for data collection</b> .....	5
<b>5. Considerations for the monitoring and evaluation of digital proximity tracing solutions</b> .....	5
<b>6. Data reporting and analysis</b> .....	5
<b>7. Limitations of the indicator framework</b> .....	5
<b>8. Glossary of terms</b> .....	5
<b>9. References</b> .....	13

**Main contributors**

European Centre for Disease Prevention and Control	Lina Nerlander
World Health Organization, Headquarters	Patricia Ndumbi
World Health Organization, Regional Office for Europe	Clayton Hamilton

**List of consulted experts**

Justus Benzler	Robert Koch Institute, Germany
Dan Bogdanov	Cybernetica AS, Estonia
Jim Buckley	Lero, University of Limerick, Ireland
Edouard Bugnion	École Polytechnique Fédérale de Lausanne (EPFL), Switzerland
Vladimir Choi	WHO Regional Office for the Western Pacific
Victor Del Rio Vilas	WHO headquarters
Wolfgang Ebbers	PBLQ & Erasmus University Rotterdam, the Netherlands
Sarah Gibney	Department of Health, Government of Ireland
Coralie Giese	Ministry of Solidarité and Health, France
Giovanna Jaramillo-Gutierrez	WHO headquarters
Christopher Haskew	WHO Regional Office for South-East Asia
Lotty Hoof	University Medical Center Utrecht, the Netherlands
Konstantin Hyppönen	Social Insurance Institution, Finland
Kura Kinfe	PBLQ, the Netherlands
Göran Kirchner	Robert Koch Institute, Germany
Riho Laast-Laas	IGLU, Estonia
Olivier Le Polain	WHO headquarters
Raquel Lucas	Faculdade de Medicina da Universidade do Porto
Gar Mac Criosta	Health Services Executive, Ireland
Esther Metting	University Medical Center Groningen, the Netherlands
Mohammed Hassan Nour	WHO Regional Office for the Eastern Mediterranean
Rui Oliveira	INSEC TEC, Portugal
Bart Preneel	KU Leuven, Belgium
Marcel Salathé	École Polytechnique Fédérale de Lausanne (EPFL), Switzerland
Milton Severo	Departamento de Matemática da Universidade de Aveiro, Portugal
Randeep Sidhu	Head of Product, Test and Trace app, UK
Carmela Troncoso	École Polytechnique Fédérale de Lausanne (EPFL), Switzerland
Viktor von Wyl	University of Zurich, Switzerland
Tamar Zalk	WHO headquarters

## Key messages

- Digital proximity tracing (DPT) is a new technology that has been increasingly adopted by countries to support conventional contact tracing efforts in combating the COVID-19 pandemic.
- This indicator framework is designed to support the evaluation of the public health effectiveness of DPT.
- The way DPT is implemented varies between countries, therefore the indicator framework provides a menu of options, which allows countries to choose indicators that are most suitable and feasible to measure in their setting.

## Executive summary

As they respond to the COVID-19 pandemic, countries worldwide have increasingly looked to digital technologies in support of public health measures for contact tracing. Digital proximity tracing, an approach that typically use smartphones or purpose-built devices to capture anonymized interactions between individuals and subsequently issue alerts, has shown promise in contributing to national contact tracing strategies. However, given that digital proximity tracing is still an emerging technology, methods for assessing and monitoring its effectiveness remain unclear. This document therefore seeks to provide national public health authorities with a list of indicators, developed in consultation with a broad range of national and regional stakeholders, that can be used as a basis for a standardized evaluation of the public health effectiveness of digital proximity tracing.

This indicator framework is intended for use by relevant national health authorities, public health and related institutions and their partners involved in the planning, implementation, monitoring and evaluation of contact tracing activities. It will be of most relevance to those with responsibility and oversight for the development and deployment of national digital proximity tracing solutions.

The proposed indicators aim to provide information on:

- the adoption and use of digital proximity tracing in the population;
- the capacity of digital proximity tracing to detect contacts at risk of infection;
- the speed with which digital proximity tracing solutions can notify contacts in comparison to conventional contact tracing mechanisms;
- barriers and enablers of digital proximity tracing approaches.

The document also provides a reflection on operational factors that may have an impact on the monitoring of digital proximity tracing applications (apps) and proposes different options for data collection for the indicators.

The information gained from these indicators can be used to assess and improve different aspects of digital proximity tracing implementation. This will help to increase its effectiveness in preventing transmission of SARS-CoV-2 and when evaluating its usefulness in the context of other pandemic mitigation measures.

预览已结束，完整报告链接和二维码如下：

[https://www.yunbaogao.cn/report/index/report?reportId=5\\_23768](https://www.yunbaogao.cn/report/index/report?reportId=5_23768)

