WHO guideline on health workforce development, attraction, recruitment and retention in rural and remote areas

An update of the WHO guideline
Increasing access to health workers in remote and rural areas through improved retention: global policy recommendations (2010)

World Health Organization

WHO guideline on health workforce development, attraction, recruitment and retention in rural and remote areas

An update of the WHO guideline
Increasing access to health workers in remote and rural areas through improved retention: global policy recommendations (2010)

World Health Organization

WHO guideline on health workforce development, attraction, recruitment and retention in rural and remote areas

ISBN 978-92-4-002422-9 (electronic version)
ISBN 978-92-4-002423-6 (print version)

© World Health Organization 2021

Some rights reserved. This work is available under the Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 IGO licence (CC BY-NC-SA 3.0 IGO; https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-sa/3.0/igo).

Under the terms of this licence, you may copy, redistribute and adapt the work for non-commercial purposes, provided the work is appropriately cited, as indicated below. In any use of this work, there should be no suggestion that WHO endorses any specific organization, products or services. The use of the WHO logo is not permitted. If you adapt the work, then you must license your work under the same or equivalent Creative Commons licence. If you create a translation of this work, you should add the following disclaimer along with the suggested citation: "This translation was not created by the World Health Organization (WHO). WHO is not responsible for the content or accuracy of this translation. The original English edition shall be the binding and authentic edition".

Any mediation relating to disputes arising under the licence shall be conducted in accordance with the mediation rules of the World Intellectual Property Organization (http://www.wipo.int/amc/en/mediation/rules/).

Suggested citation. WHO guideline on health workforce development, attraction, recruitment and retention in rural and remote areas. Geneva: World Health Organization; 2021. Licence: CC BY-NC-SA 3.0 IGO.

Cataloguing-in-Publication (CIP) data. CIP data are available at http://apps.who.int/iris.

Sales, rights and licensing. To purchase WHO publications, see http://apps.who.int/bookorders. To submit requests for commercial use and queries on rights and licensing, see http://www.who.int/about/licensing.

Third-party materials. If you wish to reuse material from this work that is attributed to a third party, such as tables, figures or images, it is your responsibility to determine whether permission is needed for that reuse and to obtain permission from the copyright holder. The risk of claims resulting from infringement of any third-party-owned component in the work rests solely with the user.

General disclaimers. The designations employed and the presentation of the material in this publication do not imply the expression of any opinion whatsoever on the part of WHO concerning the legal status of any country, territory, city or area or of its authorities, or concerning the delimitation of its frontiers or boundaries. Dotted and dashed lines on maps represent approximate border lines for which there may not yet be full agreement.

The mention of specific companies or of certain manufacturers' products does not imply that they are endorsed or recommended by WHO in preference to others of a similar nature that are not mentioned. Errors and omissions excepted, the names of proprietary products are distinguished by initial capital letters.

All reasonable precautions have been taken by WHO to verify the information contained in this publication. However, the published material is being distributed without warranty of any kind, either expressed or implied. The responsibility for the interpretation and use of the material lies with the reader. In no event shall WHO be liable for damages arising from its use.

Design by 400 Communications.

Contents

Acknowledgements vi

Glossary of terms viii

Executive summary xii

1.0 Background 1

1.1 Rationale 2

1.2 Previous recommendations on increasing access to health workers in rural and remote areas 5

1.3 Target audience 7

1.3.1 End users of the guideline 7

1.3.2 Stakeholders 7

1.4 Objectives of this guideline 7

2.0 Methods 9

2.1 Scope 9

2.1.1 Rural health workforce 10

2.1.2 Rural and remote communities: geographical considerations and definitions 10

2.1.3 Outcomes of interest 11

2.2 Process for reviewing this guideline and methodology 11

2.2.1 Contributors to the guideline 11

2.2.2 Sources of evidence for the guideline 12

2.3 Results 13

2.3.1 Systematic review of results 13

2.3.2 Stakeholder perception survey results 17

2.4 Formulation of the recommendations 17

2.5 Formulation of a good practice statement for guidelines 17

2.6 Guiding principles for the formulation of policies to improve access to health workers in rural and remote areas 18

2.6.1 Sustainable development, universal health coverage, primary health care and decent work 18

2.6.2 Gender, equity and rights 19

2.6.3 Harmonization with national health plan 20

2.6.4 Understanding the health workforce 20

2.6.5 Strengthening human resources for health management 22

2.6.6 Social accountability in health workforce education 24

3.0 Good practice statement and recommendations 25

Good practice statement for the development, attraction, recruitment and retention of health workers in rural and remote areas 25

3.1 Recommendation 1: Enrol students with a rural background in health worker education programmes 26

3.1.1 Rationale for recommendation 26

3.1.2 Implementation considerations 27

3.2 Recommendation 2: Locate health worker education facilities closer to rural areas 28

3.2.1 Rationale for recommendation 28

3.2.2 Implementation considerations 29

3.3 Recommendation 3: Bring students in health worker education programmes to rural and remote communities 30

3.3.1 Rationale for recommendation 30

3.3.2 Implementation considerations 31

3.4 Recommendation 4: Align health worker education with rural health needs 32

3.4.1 Rationale for recommendation 32

3.4.2 Implementation considerations 32

3.5 Recommendation 5: Facilitate continuing education for rural and remote health workers 33

3.5.1 Rationale for recommendation 34

3.5.2 Implementation considerations 34

3.6 Recommendation 6: Enable rural health workers to enhance their scopes of practice to better meet the needs of their communities 35

3.6.1 Rationale for recommendation 35

3.6.2 Implementation considerations 36

3.7 Recommendation 7: Expand range of health worker occupations to meet rural health needs 36

3.7.1 Rationale for recommendation 37

3.7.2 Implementation considerations 37

3.8 Recommendation 8: Ensure that compulsory service agreements respect the rights of health workers and are accompanied with appropriate support and incentives 38

3.8.1 Rationale for recommendation 38

3.8.2 Implementation considerations 39

3.9 Recommendation 9: Tie education subsidies for health workers to agreements for return of service in rural areas and remote areas 39
3.9.1 Rationale for recommendation 40
3.9.2 Implementation considerations 40
3.10 Recommendation 10: Provide a package of attractive incentives to influence health workers' decisions to relocate to or remain in a remote or rural area 41
3.10.1 Rationale for recommendation 41
3.10.2 Implementation considerations 42
3.11 Recommendation 11: Improve living conditions in rural and remote areas 43
3.11.1 Rationale for recommendation 43
3.11.2 Implementation considerations 44
3.12 Recommendation 12: Ensure workplace safety in rural and remote health facilities 44
3.12.1 Rationale for recommendation 45
3.12.2 Implementation considerations 45
3.13 Recommendation 13: Ensure decent work for health workers in rural and remote areas 46
3.13.1 Rationale for recommendation 46
3.13.2 Implementation considerations 47
3.14 Recommendation 14: Foster the creation of health workforce support networks 48
3.14.1 Rationale for recommendation 48
3.14.2 Implementation considerations 49
3.15 Recommendation 15: Develop and strengthen career pathways for rural health workers 49
3.15.1 Rationale for recommendation 50
3.15.2 Implementation considerations 50
3.16 Recommendation 16: Facilitate knowledge exchange between health workers 51
3.16.1 Rationale for recommendation 51
3.16.2 Implementation considerations 51
3.17 Recommendation 17: Raise the profile of rural health workers 52
3.17.1 Rationale for recommendation 52
3.17.2 Implementation considerations 52

4.0 Selecting and evaluating the bundle of interventions 53
4.1 Relevance: which interventions best respond to national priorities, and to the expectations of health workers and rural communities? 55
4.2 Acceptability: which interventions are politically and socioculturally acceptable and have the most stakeholder support? 55
4.3 Feasibility: which interventions face the fewest barriers to implementation? 58
4.4 Affordability: which interventions are cost effective and what is their fiscal impact? 58
4.5 Effectiveness: have complementarities and potential unintended consequences between various interventions been considered? 59
4.6 Impact: what indicators will be used to measure impact over time? 60
4.7 Dissemination and implementation plans for this guideline 60
4.7.1 Dissemination 62
4.7.2 Monitoring and evaluation 62

5.0 Research agenda 63
5.1 Expanding the evidence base 63
5.2 Mainstreaming rural access into health systems and health outcomes research 63
5.3 Ensuring evaluations are rigorous and well designed 64

6.0 Updating this guideline 65

References 66

Tables

Table 1.1 International calls to action on the health workforce 4

Table 1.2 Categories of interventions used to improve attraction, recruitment and retention of health workers in remote and rural areas (2010 guideline) 6

Table 1.3 Stakeholders impacting rural and remote health workforce policy 8

Table 2.1 Outputs and outcomes of interest 11

Table 2.2 Geographical distribution of single-country studies included in the original and updated systematic reviews by WHO region 15

Table 2.3 Health worker occupations represented in studies included in the systematic reviews 15

Table 4.1 Measuring the results of rural retention interventions 54

Table 4.2 Roles and responsibilities of stakeholders in the design and implementation of strategies to increase access to health workers in rural and remote areas (examples) 56

Table 4.3 Questions and indicators for the evaluation and monitoring of interventions to increase access to health workers in remote and rural areas through improved retention 61

Figures

Figure 2.1 PRISMA charts: original systematic review and updated systematic review 14

Figure 2.2 Studies of different health worker occupations 16

Figure 2.3 Factors related to decisions to relocate to, stay in, and leave a rural area 21

Web Annexes

https://apps.who.int/iris/bitstream/handle/10665/341112/9789240024243-eng.pdf

Web Annex A. WHO guidelines and tools that support the guideline

Web Annex B. Questions in population, intervention, comparison, outcome of interest, and setting (PICOS) format

Web Annex C. Members of Steering Group, Guideline Development Group and External Review Group, and conflict of interest management

Web Annex D. Authors of the updated systematic review (2010–2019)

Web Annex E. Checklist of criteria to be met before making a good practice recommendation, developed by the GRADE Working Group

Web Annex F. Evolution of the recommendation

Web Annex G. Summaries of evidence

Web Annex H. Summaries of evidence to decision tables

Acknowledgements

This guideline is part of the World Health Organization (WHO) programme of work on human resources for health. The concept for the revision of the guideline was initiated by James Campbell (Director, Health Workforce Department, WHO). Overall coordination of the guideline development process was led by Michelle McIsaac (Economist, Health Workforce Department, WHO).

WHO Steering Group

A WHO Steering Group led the development of the planning proposal for the guideline, identified members of the Guideline Development Group and External Review Group, facilitated the Guideline Development Group meetings and contributed to drafting the guideline document. The Steering Group comprised the following WHO staff members: Adam Ahmat, Regional Adviser, Human Resources for Health and Planning, WHO Regional Office for Africa; Onyema Ajuebor, Technical Officer, Health Workforce, WHO headquarters; Shannon Barkley, Technical Officer, Clinical Services and Systems, WHO headquarters; Gulin Gedik, Regional Adviser, Health Workforce Development, WHO Regional Office for the Eastern Mediterranean; Jose Francisco Garcia Gutierrez, Adviser, Human Resources Development, Pan American Health Organization; Indrajit Hazarika, Regional Adviser, Health Workforce Policy, WHO Regional Office for the Western Pacific; Margrieta Langins, Adviser, Primary Health Care Workforce, WHO Regional Office for Europe; Inke Mathauer, Senior Health Global Health, Stellenbosch University, Cape Town, South Africa; Gilles Dussault, Institute of Hygiene and Tropical Medicine, Lisbon, Portugal; Mayara Floss, Rural Seeds and WWPRP, Porto Alegre, Brazil; Amel Gesmalla, Human Resources for Health Directorate, Ministry of Health, Sudan; Michael Glasser, University of Illinois, Illinois, United States of America; Mona Gupta, National Health Systems Resource Centre, Ministry of Health and Family Welfare, New Delhi, India; Margaret Phiri, Seed Global Health, Lilongwe, Malawi; Roger Strasser, Northern Ontario School of Medicine, Ontario, Canada; Julia Tainjoki-Seyer, World Medical Association, France; Viroj Tangcharoensathien, International Health Policy Programme, Ministry of Public Health, Thailand (Co-Chair); Paul Worley, Rural Access Branch, Department of Health, Australia.

External Review Group

The following experts served as external peer reviewers of the draft guideline document: Edson Araujo, World Bank Group, United States

预览已结束，完整报告链接和二维码如下：

https://www.yunbaogao.cn/report/index/report?reportId=5_23920