

WHAT DO WE KNOW ABOUT COMMUNITY HEALTH WORKERS? A SYSTEMATIC REVIEW OF EXISTING REVIEWS

Human Resources for Health Observer Series No 19



WHAT DO WE KNOW ABOUT COMMUNITY HEALTH WORKERS? A SYSTEMATIC REVIEW OF EXISTING REVIEWS

Human Resources for Health Observer Series No 19

What do we know about community health workers? A systematic review of existing reviews (Human Resources for Health Observer Series No. 19)
ISBN 978-92-4-151202-2 (electronic version)
ISBN 978-92-4-001526-5 (print version)

© World Health Organization 2020

Some rights reserved. This work is available under the Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 IGO licence (CC BY-NC-SA 3.0 IGO; https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-sa/3.0/igo).

Under the terms of this licence, you may copy, redistribute and adapt the work for non-commercial purposes, provided the work is appropriately cited, as indicated below. In any use of this work, there should be no suggestion that WHO endorses any specific organization, products or services. The use of the WHO logo is not permitted. If you adapt the work, then you must license your work under the same or equivalent Creative Commons licence. If you create a translation of this work, you should add the following disclaimer along with the suggested citation: "This translation was not created by the World Health Organization (WHO). WHO is not responsible for the content or accuracy of this translation. The original English edition shall be the binding and authentic edition".

Any mediation relating to disputes arising under the licence shall be conducted in accordance with the mediation rules of the World Intellectual Property Organization (http://www.wipo.int/amc/en/mediation/rules/).

Suggested citation. What do we know about community health workers? A systematic review of existing reviews. Geneva: World Health Organization; 2020 (Human Resources for Health Observer Series No. 19). Licence: CC BY-NC-SA 3.0 IGO; https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-sa/3.0/igo.

 $\textbf{Cataloguing-in-Publication (CIP) data}. \ \textbf{CIP data are available at http://apps.who.int/iris.}$

Sales, rights and licensing. To purchase WHO publications, see http://apps.who.int/bookorders. To submit requests for commercial use and queries on rights and licensing, see http://www.who.int/about/licensing.

Third-party materials. If you wish to reuse material from this work that is attributed to a third party, such as tables, figures or images, it is your responsibility to determine whether permission is needed for that reuse and to obtain permission from the copyright holder. The risk of claims resulting from infringement of any third-party-owned component in the work rests solely with the user.

General disclaimers. The designations employed and the presentation of the material in this publication do not imply the expression of any opinion whatsoever on the part of WHO concerning the legal status of any country, territory, city or area or of its authorities, or concerning the delimitation of its frontiers or boundaries. Dotted and dashed lines on maps represent approximate border lines for which there may not yet be full agreement.

The mention of specific companies or of certain manufacturers' products does not imply that they are endorsed or recommended by WHO in preference to others of a similar nature that are not mentioned. Errors and omissions excepted, the names of proprietary products are distinguished by initial capital letters.

All reasonable precautions have been taken by WHO to verify the information contained in this publication. However, the published material is being distributed without warranty of any kind, either expressed or implied. The responsibility for the interpretation and use of the material lies with the reader. In no event shall WHO be liable for damages arising from its use.

This review was conducted in the scope of preparation of the 2018 WHO Guideline on Health policy and system support to optimize community health worker programmes. Updates to the Guideline, which are not explicitly planned at the date of this publication, will include evidence generated subsequent to the completion of this review.

Contents

Ackno	owledg	ments	V
Abbre	eviatio	ns	<mark>vi</mark>
Execu	ıtive sı	ımmary	vii
1. Bac	karour	1d	1
1.1	_	on	
1.2		S	
	,		
2. Me		rces and search strategy	
2.1		ection.	
۷.۷	2.2.1	Eligibility criteria and screening.	
	2.2.2	Data extraction	
	2.2.3	Assessment and reporting on methodological quality.	
	2.2.4	Data analysis.	
3.1		esults	
3.2	•	farticles	
3.3		characteristics	
3.4		ity health worker roles and capacities	
3.5		ervice/programme-related effectiveness	10
	3.5.1	Community health worker roles, capacities and health outcomes as reported in reviews from HICs.	1/
	3.5.2	Community health worker roles, capacities and health outcomes as reported in reviews	14
	0.0	from LMICs	19
3.6	Training		32
	3.6.1	Length of training	32
	3.6.2	Training tools	32
	3.6.3	Training and community health worker competency.	32
	3.6.4	Training and community health worker effectiveness	
	3.6.5	Training and other benefits	
	3.6.6	Education prerequisites in community health worker selection	33

4
-
-

	3.7	Deployment	33
	3.8	Performance measurement.	34
	3.9	Remuneration and other incentives	35
	3.10	Support and supervision.	37
	3.11	Cost-effectiveness	39
	3.12	Community embeddedness	40
		3.12.1 Benefits of community embeddedness	41
		3.12.2 Facilitators of community embeddedness	41
		3.12.2 Barriers to community embeddedness	42
	3.13	Infrastructure and supplies.	42
	3.14	Integration into the health system.	43
4.	Disc	cussion and synthesis	47
	4.1	What are the optimal types and numbers of interventions that CHWs can perform and how can they best be provided?	V
	4.2	Lessons for CHW programme design and implementation.	47
	4.3	Gaps in the evidence.	48
5.	Con	nclusions	50
R	efere	ences	51
		: 1: PubMed search strategy	
A	nnex	2: Included and excluded articles	62
A	nnex	3: AMSTAR assessments (n=122)	71
Fi	gures		
Fiç	jure 3.	1 Flow diagram of review selection process	5
Ta	bles		
Ta	ble 2.1	Data extraction framework on health system integration of community health workers.	3
Ta	ble 3.1	Quality of systematic reviews (n=75) by AMSTAR item	6
Ta	ble 3.2	Quality of systematic reviews by AMSTAR article score (relaxed criteria)	6

Table 3.3	Quality of systematic reviews by AMSTAR article score (strict criteria)	7
Table 3.4	Regions included in reviews.	7
Table 3.5	Focal health issues in the included reviews	8
Table 3.6	Health system functions of community health workers	9
Table 3.7	Community health worker capacities for delivering specific health interventions	10
Table 3.8	Multiple primary health care and health system-related HIC reviews	14
Table 3.9	Underserved population-related HIC reviews	15
Table 3.10	Maternal and child health HIC reviews.	16
Table 3.11	Noncommunicable disease HIC reviews	16
Table 3.12	Infectious disease HIC reviews.	18
Table 3.13	Community-based practitioner rights and well-being-related low- and middle-income country reviews.	18
Table 3.14	Primary health care LMIC reviews	19
Table 3.15	Health system-related LMIC reviews	20
Table 3.16	Community health worker rights and well-being related LMIC reviews	21
Table 3.17	Maternal and child health LMIC reviews.	22
Table 3.18	Noncommunicable disease LMIC reviews.	28
Table 3.19	Infectious disease LMIC reviews.	29
Table 3.20	Other LMIC reviews.	31
Table 3.21	Summary findings on training.	31
Table 3.22	Summary findings on deployment	33
Table 3.23	Summary findings on performance measurement	34
Table 3.24	Summary findings on remuneration and incentives	35
Table 3.25	Summary findings on support and supervision	36
Table 3.26	Summary findings on cost–effectiveness	39
Table 3.27	Summary findings on community embeddedness	40
Table 3.28	Summary findings on infrastructure and supplies	41
Table 3.29	Summary findings on health system integration	43

Acknowledgments

The development of this report was coordinated by Giorgio Cometto (Global Health Workforce Alliance and Health Workforce Department, WHO), under the oversight of James Campbell (Director, Health Workforce, and Executive Director, Global Health Workforce Alliance, WHO). The analyses and the development of the contents of the report were led by Kerry Scott, Sarah Beckham, Margaret Gross, George Pariyo, Krishna Rao and Henry Perry (Johns Hopkins Bloomberg School of Public Health, United States of America).

The authors would like to express their appreciation for the helpful contributions by Dena Javadi (Alliance for Health Policy and Systems Research, WHO) and Elie Akl (American University in Beirut) for their helpful comments and inputs in the conceptualization and quality assurance of this analysis.

This study was funded by Norad, through grants managed by the Alliance for Health Policy and Systems Research and the Global Health Workforce Alliance partnerships hosted and administered by the World Health Organization.

Suggested citation: Kerry Scott, Sarah Beckham, Margaret Gross, George Pariyo, Krishna Rao, Giorgio Cometto and Henry B Perry. The state-of-the art knowledge on integration of community-based health workers in health systems: a systematic review of literature reviews. Human Resources for Health Observer Series No 19. World Health Organization, 2017.

Correspondence: comettog@who.int

预览已结束, 完整报告链接和二维码如下:

https://www.yunbaogao.cn/report/index/report?reportId=5 23974

