

# **DEVELOPMENTAL DIFFICULTIES IN EARLY CHILDHOOD**

Prevention, early identification,  
assessment and intervention in  
low- and middle-income countries

**A REVIEW**



World Health  
Organization

## WHO Library Cataloguing-in-Publication Data

Developmental difficulties in early childhood: prevention, early identification, assessment and intervention in low- and middle-income countries: a review.

1.Child development. 2.Child welfare. 3.Child health services. 4.Health promotion. 5.Developing countries. I.Ertem, Ilgi Ozturk. II.World Health Organization.

ISBN 978 92 4 150354 9

(NLM classification: WS 105)

### © World Health Organization 2012

All rights reserved. Publications of the World Health Organization are available on the WHO web site ([www.who.int](http://www.who.int)) or can be purchased from WHO Press, World Health Organization, 20 Avenue Appia, 1211 Geneva 27, Switzerland (tel.: +41 22 791 3264; fax: +41 22 791 4857; e-mail: [bookorders@who.int](mailto:bookorders@who.int)).

Requests for permission to reproduce or translate WHO publications – whether for sale or for noncommercial distribution – should be addressed to WHO Press through the WHO web site ([http://www.who.int/about/licensing/copyright\\_form/en/index.html](http://www.who.int/about/licensing/copyright_form/en/index.html)).

The designations employed and the presentation of the material in this publication do not imply the expression of any opinion whatsoever on the part of the World Health Organization concerning the legal status of any country, territory, city or area or of its authorities, or concerning the delimitation of its frontiers or boundaries. Dotted lines on maps represent approximate border lines for which there may not yet be full agreement.

The mention of specific companies or of certain manufacturers' products does not imply that they are endorsed or recommended by the World Health Organization in preference to others of a similar nature that are not mentioned. Errors and omissions excepted, the names of proprietary products are distinguished by initial capital letters.

All reasonable precautions have been taken by the World Health Organization to verify the information contained in this publication. However, the published material is being distributed without warranty of any kind, either expressed or implied. The responsibility for the interpretation and use of the material lies with the reader. In no event shall the World Health Organization be liable for damages arising from its use.

The named author is responsible for the views expressed in this publication.

Design by minimum graphics

Printed and disseminated with support from UNICEF (Turkey Country Office and CEECIS Regional Office).

Printed in Turkey

# CONTENTS

Acknowledgements	v
<b>Chapter 1. Introduction and overview</b>	<b>1</b>
Scope of the review	2
Terminology	2
The WHO Developmental Difficulties in Early Childhood Survey	3
Construction of the survey	3
Identification of respondents	3
Limitations of the survey	4
Outline of chapters	4
<b>Chapter 2. Early childhood development and health care systems</b>	<b>6</b>
Purpose of chapter and additional key references	6
Conceptualization of child development	7
The importance of the early years	8
The role of the health care system	9
Summary of research	10
The role of primary health care	11
Developmental–behavioural paediatrics	12
Conclusions and implications for action	13
<b>Chapter 3. Epidemiology of developmental difficulties in young children</b>	<b>14</b>
Purpose of chapter and additional key references	14
Conceptualization	14
Summary of research from LAMI countries	14
Conclusions and implications for action	17
<b>Chapter 4. Developmental risks and protective factors in young children</b>	<b>18</b>
Purpose and scope of chapter	18
Conceptualization of risk and protective factors	18
Resilience and protective factors	18
Risk factors	19
The life-cycle approach to developmental risk factors	20
Summary of research from LAMI countries	21
Resilience and protective factors in young children	21
Risk factors in young children	22
Conclusions and implications for action	31
<b>Chapter 5. Prevention of developmental difficulties</b>	<b>33</b>
Purpose of chapter and additional key resources	33
Conceptualization	34
A model for preventing developmental difficulties in early childhood	34
Research in LAMI countries	35

An exemplary model from a developing country: the WHO/UNICEF Care for Child Development Intervention	38
Conclusions and implications for action	39
<b>Chapter 6. Early detection of developmental difficulties</b>	<b>41</b>
Purpose of chapter	41
Conceptualization	41
Research in LAMI countries	42
An example from a developing country	47
Conclusions and implications for action	50
<b>Chapter 7. Developmental assessment of young children</b>	<b>51</b>
Purpose of chapter and additional key references	51
Conceptualization	51
Research in LAMI countries	53
Assessment processes	53
Assessment instruments	54
Conclusions and implications for action	57
<b>Chapter 8. International classification systems for developmental difficulties in young children</b>	<b>59</b>
Purpose and scope of the chapter and additional key resources	59
Conceptualization	59
The Diagnostic Classification of Mental Health and Developmental Disorders of Infancy and Early Childhood	60
The International Classification of Diseases	61
International Classification of Functioning, Disability, and Health	61
Application of classification systems	62
Strengths of the classification systems and areas that require improvement	63
Research in LAMI countries	65
Conclusions and implications	65
<b>Chapter 9. Early intervention (EI)</b>	<b>67</b>
Purpose and scope of the chapter and additional key resources	67
Conceptualization	68
What are EI services?	69
Who are EI services for?	69
What major improvements are needed in the conceptualization of EI?	70
Evidence-based best practices in early intervention	71
Summary of research in LAMI countries	71
Important questions for future research	74
An exemplary model from LAMI countries	75
Conclusions and implications for action	77
<b>Chapter 10. From prevention to intervention: consensus of experts</b>	<b>78</b>
Advancing policy related to developmental difficulties in early childhood at national levels	78
Bringing down barriers using common international approaches and platforms	79
Increasing local capacity by training personnel	79
Increasing capacity in other specialities related to developmental difficulties	80
Empowering caregivers	80
Conducting research	80
<b>References</b>	<b>81</b>
<b>Annex 1</b>	<b>101</b>

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The World Health Organization wishes to express its deep gratitude to the author of this review, Dr Ilgi Ozturk Ertem, Professor of Pediatrics, Director, Developmental-Behavioral Pediatrics Division, Ankara University School of Medicine, Ankara, Turkey, and visiting professor (2006–2007) at Yale University School of Medicine Department of Pediatrics, New Haven, CT, USA.

The project was led and supervised by Dr Meena Cabral de Mello, Senior Scientist, Department of Maternal, Newborn, Child and Adolescent Health, WHO, Geneva.

This document was reviewed internally by members of the WHO Department of Child and Adolescent Health and the Disability and Rehabilitation Team, and externally by international experts in the field including: Dr Vibha Krishnamurty, Director, Ummeed Child Development Centre, Mumbai, India; Professor Nicholas Lennox, Director, Queensland Centre for Intellectual and Developmental Disability, Brisbane, Australia; Dr Shamim Muhammed, Sangath Organization, Goa, India; Dr Olayinka Omigbodun, Department of Psychiatry, University of Ibadan, Ibadan, Nigeria; Professor Trevor R Parmenter, Director, Centre for Developmental Disability Studies, Sydney, Australia; Professor Atif Rahman, Chair, Department of Child Psychiatry, University of Liverpool, Liverpool, England; Dr Chiara Servili, WHO Eritrea Country Office Asmara (2008); Professor Rune Simeonsson, Professor of School Psychology and Early Childhood Education, University of North Carolina, Chapel Hill, USA; Dr Aisha Yousafzai, Child Health and Disability, Aga Khan University Human Development Program and Aga Khan University Medical College, Department of Paediatrics and Child Health, Karachi, Pakistan, and Dr Nurper Ulkuer, Chief, Early Childhood Development Unit/PDO, United Nations Children's Fund, USA.

Federico Montero and Alana Officer, WHO Disability and Rehabilitation Team, Dr Mercedes de Onis, WHO Department of Nutrition and Dr Tarun Dua, WHO Department of Mental Health provided invaluable comments and suggestions.

Thanks are due to Professor Michael Guralnick (President of the International Society of Early Intervention), Professor David J Schonfeld (past President of the Society of Developmental Behavioral Pediatrics and director of the Developmental Behavioral Pediatrics Division, Cincinnati Children's Hospital), Professor Matthew Melmed (Director of Zero to Three), and Drs John M Levental, Brian Forsyth and Carol Weitzman (Yale University School of Medicine) for their review and comments on the survey, *Developmental Difficulties in Early Childhood*.

Dr Ertem's consultations with Professor Barry Zuckerman (Chairman of Pediatrics, Boston University School of Medicine, Boston, USA), for this review was supported by a Leadership Development, Fellow's Collaboration grant from Zero to Three. We also thank Zero to Three for providing the gift of an issue of *Zero to Three Journal* for the respondents of the survey.

Most importantly, we are grateful to the numerous experts around the world for their invaluable contributions to the *Developmental Difficulties in Early Childhood Survey*. These include:

Argentina: Horacio Lejerraga, MD, Head of Department of Growth and Development. Hospital de Pediatría Garrahan. Buenos Aires, Argentina. [hlejarraga@garrahan.gov.ar](mailto:hlejarraga@garrahan.gov.ar)

Australia: Frank Oberklaid, MD, Professor, Centre for Community Child Health, Royal Children's Hospital, Melbourne, Victoria, Australia. [frank.oberklaid@rch.org.au](mailto:frank.oberklaid@rch.org.au)

Bangladesh: Naila Khan PhD, Professor, Child Development and Neurology Unit, Dhaka Shishu (Children's) Hospital, Sher-e-Bangla Nagar, Dhaka, Bangladesh. [naila.z.khan@gmail.com](mailto:naila.z.khan@gmail.com)

Brazil: Jose Salomao Schwartzman, MD, Professor, Developmental Disorders Postgraduation Program, Mackenzie Presbyterian University. São Paulo, Brazil [josess@terra.com.br](mailto:josess@terra.com.br)

- Bulgaria: Aneta Popivanova, MD, Assistant Professor of Neonatology, University Clinic of Neonatology, University Hospital of Obstetrics and Gynaecology, Sophia, apopivanova@abv.bg
- Canada: Emmett Francoeur, MD, Director, Child Development Program and Developmental Behavioral Pediatric Services, Montreal Children's Hospital, McGill University Health Center, Montreal Children's Hospital, Montreal, Quebec, Canada. emmett.francoeur@mcgill.ca
- Chile: Paula Bedregal, MD, MPH, PhD, Professor of Public Health, School of Medicine, Pontificia Universidad Católica de Chile, Santiago, Chile, pbedrega@med.puc.cl
- China: Jin Xing Ming, MD, Department of Development and Behavioral Pediatrics, Shanghai Children's Medical Center, School of Medicine, Shanghai Jiaotong University, Shanghai 200127, China, zhujing7@public7.sta.net.cn
- Egypt : Ala'a Ibrahim Shukrallah MD, Head of Training and Research Unit, Development Support Centre, 30 Haroun St, Geiza, Egypt, alaashuk@yahoo.com
- France: Philippe Compagnon, MD, Hôpital Sainte Thérèse, Bastogne, Belgium philippe.compagnon@wanadoo.fr
- Gaza Strip and West Bank: Alam Jarrar, MD, Director, Rehabilitation Program, West Bank and Gaza, Ramallah, Palestine, allam@pmrs.ps
- Georgia: Nana Tatishvili, MD, Medical director and head of neurology service, M.Iashvili Central Childrens Hospital, Tbilisi, Georgia. n\_tatishvili@mail.ru
- India: MKC Nair, MD, Professor of Pediatrics & Clinical Epidemiology Director, Child Development Centre Medical College, Thiruvananthapuram Kerala, India. nairmkc@rediffmail.com
- Vibha Krishnamurthy, MD, Director, Ummeed Child Development Center, Mumbai, India. vibha.krish@gmail.com
- Indonesia: Anna Alisjahbana, MD, PhD, Professor Emeritus, Founder and Chairperson Surya Kanti Foundation (YSK), "Center for the Development of Child Potentials" Consultant & Advisor, Bandung, Indonesia. alisja\_a@melsa.net.id
- Israel: Gary Diamond, MD, Director, Child Development Services, Clalit Health Maintenance Organization, Dan Region, Israel, and Vice Director Child Development Institute Schneider Childrens Medical Center of Israel, Petah Tikva, Israel. diamondg@zahav.net.il
- Jordan: Saleh Al-Oraibi, PhD, MCSP, Assistant Professor, AL- Hashmite University , Faculty of Allied Health Sciences, Physical Therapy and Rehabilitation Department, Zarka, Jordan, so55@hu.edu.jo
- Kyrgyzstan: Nurmuhammed Babadjan, Chief of pediatric rehabilitation department, National Center of Pediatrics. nurmuhammed-babad@mail.ru
- Gulmira Nagimidinova, Director of IMCI Center of National Center of Pediatrics and Child Surgery, assistant of department of family medicine of Kyrgyz State Medical Academy, Bishkek, Kryrgyzstan. nt\_gulmira@yahoo.com
- Lebanon: Moussa Charafeddine, Vice President Inclusion International, Secretary General Lebanese Parents & Institutional Associations for Intellectually Disabled, President Of MENA Region Inclusion International, President, Friends of Disabled Association-Lebanon, Beirut, Lebanon. moussa@friendsfordisabled.org.lb
- Malaysia: Amar Singh HSS, MD, Senior Consultant Paediatrician, Consultant Community Paediatrician Head of Paediatric Department, Ipoh Hospital, Perak, Malaysia. amimar@pc.jaring.my
- Pakistan: Zeba A. Rasmussen, Vice Chairman, Chief Executive Officer, Mehnaz Fatima Educational and Welfare Organization, Shahrah-e-Quaid-e-Azam Near Family Health Hospital, Jutial , Gilgit, Pakistan. zebasmussen@yahoo.com, zeba@comsats.net.pk
- Phillipines: Alexis Reyes, MD, Professor, Institute of Child Health and Human Development, University of the Philippines, National Institutes of Health, Manila, Philippines. alexis7591@gmail.com
- Romania: Adrian Toma, MD, Chief of the Neonatology Unit, "Panait Sarbu" Obstetrics and Gynecology Hospital, Bucharest, Romania. tomaotiadi@yahoo.com

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Russian Federation: Akaterina Klochkova, PhD, Head of physiotherapy department, St. Petersburg Pavlov Medical University, St Peterburg Early Intervention Institute, St Petersburg, Russian Federation. katya@klo.ioffe.ru

Saudi Arabia: Saleh M. Al Salehi Al Harbi, MD, Medical Director, Children's Hospital, Consultant developmental behavioral pediatrics, King Fahad Medical City, Riyadh, Saudi Arabia, sssnm3@hotmail.com, salsalhi@kfmc.med.sa

Singapore: Rosebeth Marcou, MD, Developmental and Behavioural Paediatrician, Raffles Hospital, Singapore. drmarcou@gmail.com

South Africa: Colleen Adnams, MD, Senior Specialist and Lecturer Head, Developmental (Clinical) Service and Division of Paediatric Neurosciences, Red Cross War Memorial Children's Hospital and School of Child and Adolescent Health, University of Cape Town, South Africa. Colleen.Adnams@uct.ac.za

Turkey: Drs Ilgi Ertem, Derya Gumus Dogan, Bahar Bingoler Pekcici, Ozlem Unal. Developmental-Behavioral Pediatrics Division, Department of Pediatrics, Ankara University School of Medicine, Ankara, Turkey. ertemilgi@yahoo.com

United Kingdom: Val Harpin, MD, Consultant Paediatrician (neurodisability), Ryegate Children's Centre, Sheffield, United Kingdom, val.harpin@sch.nhs.uk

United Republic of Tanzania: Augustine Massawe, MD, Senior Lecturer, Consultant Paediatrician and neonatologist, Muhimbili National Hospital, Muhimbili University College of Health Sciences, Dar es Salaam, Tanzania. draugustine.massawe@gmail.com

United States of America: David J. Schonfeld, MD, Director, Division of Developmental and Behavioral Pediatrics Cincinnati Children's Hospital Medical Center, Cincinnati, Ohio, United States. david.schonfeld@cchmc.org

Viet Nam: Tran Thi Thu Ha, MD, Vice Director of the Rehabilitation Department, National Hospital of Pediatrics, Rehabilitation Director, Hope Center, Hanoi, Vietnam. mdthuha@yahoo.com

For further information about this document please contact Meena Cabral de Mello, Senior Scientist and WHO Focal Person for Early Childhood Development in the Department of Child and Adolescent Health, WHO/HQ, who led and managed this project.

This document is a part of a series of evidence based reviews intended to guide interventions to improve the health, growth and development of children, particularly those living in resource-poor settings. The other reviews of relevance are:

- *A critical link: Interventions for physical growth and psychological development.* WHO/CHS/CAH/99.3 (1999).
- *Family and community practices that promote child survival, growth and development: A review of the evidence.* WHO. ISBN 92 4 159150 1 (2004).
- *The importance of caregiver-child interactions for the survival and healthy development of young children.* WHO. ISBN 924159134X (2004).
- *Mental health and psychosocial well-being among children in severe food shortage situations.* WHO/MSD/MER/06.1 (2006).
- Responsive parenting: interventions and outcomes (2006). *Bulletin of the World Health Organization*, 84:992-999.
- *The role of the health sector in strengthening systems to support children's healthy development in communities affected by HIV/AIDS: A review.* WHO. ISBN 9241594624. (2006).
- *Early child development: A powerful equalizer* (2007). Final Report for the World Health Organization's Commission on Social Determinants of Health. [http://www.who.int/child\\_adolescent\\_health/documents/ecd\\_final\\_m30/en/](http://www.who.int/child_adolescent_health/documents/ecd_final_m30/en/)
- The Lancet: Child development in developing countries series. *The Lancet*, Vol 369 January 6, 2007. [http://www.who.int/child\\_adolescent\\_health/documents/lancet\\_child\\_development/en/index.html](http://www.who.int/child_adolescent_health/documents/lancet_child_development/en/index.html)

- The Lancet: Child Development 1. Inequality in early childhood: risk and protective factors for early child development. *Lancet* 2011; 378: 1325–38 <http://www.thelancet.com/journals/lancet/article/PIIS0140-6736%2811%2960555-2/fulltext>.
- The Lancet: Child Development 2: Strategies for reducing inequalities and improving developmental outcomes for young children in low-income and middle-income countries. *Lancet* 2011; 378: 1325–38. <http://www.thelancet.com/journals/lancet/article/PIIS0140-6736%2811%2960889-1/fulltext>
- *Facts for life*. UNICEF. Fourth edition (2010). ISBN: 9789280644661.

**To obtain copies of the above documents and for further information, please contact:**

Department of Maternal, Newborn, Child and Adolescent Health  
World Health Organization  
20 Avenue Appia  
1211 Geneva 27  
Switzerland

Tel: +41 22 791 3281

Fax: +41 22 791 4853

Email: [cah@who.int](mailto:cah@who.int)

Web site: <http://www.who.int/child-adolescent-health>

预览已结束，完整报告链接和二维码如下：

[https://www.yunbaogao.cn/report/index/report?reportId=5\\_28533](https://www.yunbaogao.cn/report/index/report?reportId=5_28533)

