

# Handbook on Monitoring and Evaluation of Human Resources for Health



with special applications for  
low- and middle-income countries





# Handbook on Monitoring and Evaluation of Human Resources for Health

with special applications for  
low- and middle-income countries

Edited by Mario R Dal Poz, Neeru Gupta,  
Estelle Quain and Agnes LB Soucat



WHO Library Cataloguing-in-Publication Data

**Handbook on monitoring and evaluation of human resources for health: with special applications for low- and middle-income countries / edited by Mario R Dal Poz ... [et al].**

1.Health manpower. 2.Health personnel – administration and organization. 3.Health personnel – statistics and numerical data. 4.Personnel management. 5.Qualitative analysis. 6.Developing countries. I.Dal Poz, Mario R II.Gupta, Neeru. III.Quain, Estelle IV.Soucat, Agnes LB V.World Health Organization. VI.World Bank. VII.United States. Agency for International Development.

ISBN 978 92 4 154770 3 (NLM classification: W 76)

**© World Health Organization 2009**

All rights reserved. Publications of the World Health Organization can be obtained from WHO Press, World Health Organization, 20 Avenue Appia, 1211 Geneva 27, Switzerland (tel.: +41 22 791 3264; fax: +41 22 791 4857; e-mail: [bookorders@who.int](mailto:bookorders@who.int)). Requests for permission to reproduce or translate WHO publications – whether for sale or for noncommercial distribution – should be addressed to WHO Press, at the above address (fax: +41 22 791 4806; e-mail: [permissions@who.int](mailto:permissions@who.int)).

The designations employed and the presentation of the material in this publication do not imply the expression of any opinion whatsoever on the part of the World Health Organization, World Bank or United States Agency for International Development concerning the legal status of any country, territory, city or area or of its authorities, or concerning the delimitation of its frontiers or boundaries. Dotted lines on maps represent approximate border lines for which there may not yet be full agreement.

The mention of specific companies or of certain manufacturers' products does not imply that they are endorsed or recommended by the World Health Organization, World Bank or United States Agency for International Development in preference to others of a similar nature that are not mentioned. Errors and omissions excepted, the names of proprietary products are distinguished by initial capital letters.

All reasonable precautions have been taken by the World Health Organization, World Bank and United States Agency for International Development to verify the information contained in this publication. However, the published material is being distributed without warranty of any kind, either expressed or implied. The responsibility for the interpretation and use of the material lies with the reader. In no event shall the World Health Organization, World Bank or United States Agency for International Development be liable for damages arising from its use.

The named authors of each chapter alone are responsible for the views expressed in this publication.

Photos: Front cover, left; back cover; pages 23 and 157: Curt Carnemark, World Bank. Front cover, center; and page 1: Ray Witlin, World Bank. Front cover, right; and page 61: Tran Thi Hoa, World Bank.

Printed in India

Editing, design and indexing by Inís Communication: [www.inis.ie](http://www.inis.ie)

# Contents

<b>List of tables, figures and boxes</b>	.vi
<b>Preface</b>	.x
<b>Acknowledgements</b>	.xi
<b>List of contributors</b>	.xii
<b>Acronyms and abbreviations</b>	.xiii
<b>Part I: OVERVIEW</b>	.1
<b>1 Monitoring and evaluation of human resources for health: challenges and opportunities</b>	.3
1.1 Introduction	.3
1.2 Global initiatives on HRH and information systems	.3
1.3 Key issues and challenges	.7
1.4 Framework for health workforce monitoring: the working lifespan approach	.8
1.5 Road map	.9
1.6 Further information and comments	.11
References	.12
<b>2 Boundaries of the health workforce: definition and classifications of health workers</b>	.13
2.1 Introduction	.13
2.2 Who are health workers?	.13
2.3 Health workforce classification	.14
2.4 Summary and conclusions	.21
References	.22
<b>Part II: MONITORING THE STAGES OF THE WORKING LIFESPAN</b>	.23
<b>3 Monitoring the active health workforce: indicators, data sources and illustrative analysis</b>	.25
3.1 Introduction	.25
3.2 Core indicators for HRH analysis: what needs to be monitored?	.26
3.3 Overview of potential data sources	.27
3.4 Illustrative analysis	.31
3.5 Putting it all together: governance and use of HRH information sources	.33
3.6 Summary and conclusions	.34
References	.36

<b>4</b>	<b>Framework and measurement issues for monitoring entry into the health workforce</b>	37
4.1	Introduction	37
4.2	Framework for monitoring entry	38
4.3	Measurement issues	42
4.4	Summary and conclusions	47
	References	47
<b>5</b>	<b>Monitoring health workforce transitions and exits</b>	49
5.1	Introduction	49
5.2	Transitions within and exits from the health workforce: a framework for analysis	49
5.3	Indicators and measurement strategies	51
5.4	Illustrative analyses	53
5.5	Concluding remarks: implications for policy and planning	57
	References	58
	<b>Part III: MEASUREMENT STRATEGIES AND CASE STUDIES</b>	61
<b>6</b>	<b>Measuring expenditure on the health workforce: concepts, data sources and methods</b>	63
6.1	Introduction	63
6.2	What should be measured	64
6.3	Approaches to measuring HRH expenditure	65
6.4	Measurement frameworks and applications	71
6.5	Summary, conclusions and further developments	76
	References	77
<b>7</b>	<b>Use of facility-based assessments in health workforce analysis</b>	79
7.1	Introduction	79
7.2	How facility-based assessments can be used for health workforce monitoring	80
7.3	Overview of key HFA methodologies	81
7.4	Some limitations of HFA methodologies for HRH data	85
7.5	Empirical examples based on HFA data	86
7.6	Summary and conclusions	98
	References	100
<b>8</b>	<b>Use of population census data for gender analysis of the health workforce</b>	103
8.1	Introduction	103
8.2	Importance of gender considerations in health workforce analysis	103
8.3	Using census data for health workforce analysis	104
8.4	Empirical analysis	106
8.5	Summary and conclusions	110
	References	111

<b>9 Use of administrative data sources for health workforce analysis: multicountry experience in implementation of human resources information systems</b> . . . . .	113
9.1 Introduction . . . . .	113
9.2 Recommended first steps to develop a human resources information system. . . . .	114
9.3 Country case studies . . . . .	119
9.4 Summary and conclusions . . . . .	125
References. . . . .	126
<b>10 Understanding health workforce issues: a selective guide to the use of qualitative methods</b> . . . . .	129
10.1 Introduction . . . . .	129
10.2 Qualitative methods: their value and potential. . . . .	130
10.3 Issues in the design and implementation of a qualitative study. . . . .	132
10.4 Summary and conclusions . . . . .	143
References. . . . .	144
<b>11 Analysis and synthesis of information on human resources for health from multiple sources: selected case studies</b> . . . . .	147
11.1 Introduction . . . . .	147
11.2 Identification of potential information sources and their use to estimate indicators of health labour market participation in Mexico. . . . .	147
11.3 Using multiple sources of information to produce best estimates of India's health workforce . . . . .	150
11.4 Triangulation of data from two different sources for monitoring health worker absenteeism and ghost workers in Zambia . . . . .	152
11.5 Summary and conclusions . . . . .	154
References. . . . .	155
<b>Part IV: DATA DISSEMINATION AND USE</b> . . . . .	157
<b>12 Getting information and evidence into policy-making and practice: strategies and mechanisms</b> . . . . .	159
12.1 Introduction . . . . .	159
12.2 Strategies to get evidence into policy and practice . . . . .	160
12.3 A mechanism to harness the HRH agenda: health workforce observatories . . . . .	162
12.4 Opportunities and directions . . . . .	169
References. . . . .	170
<b>Index</b> . . . . .	173
<b>About the publishing agencies</b> . . . . .	176

# List of tables, figures and boxes

## TABLES

<b>Table 2.1</b> Framework for defining the health workforce . . . . .	14
<b>Table 2.2</b> Relevant levels of education and training for health occupations according to the International Standard Classification of Education (ISCED-1997) . . . . .	15
<b>Table 2.3</b> Fields of vocational training related to health according to <i>Fields of training</i> manual . . . . .	17
<b>Table 2.4</b> Occupational titles related to health according to the International Standard Classification of Occupations (ISCO), 1988 and 2008 revisions . . . . .	18
<b>Table 2.5</b> Economic sectors related to health activities on the basis of the International Standard Industrial Classification of All Economic Activities (ISIC) Revision 4 . . . . .	20
<b>Table 3.1</b> Selected key indicators for monitoring and evaluation of human resources for health . . . . .	28
<b>Table 3.2</b> Potential data sources for monitoring the health workforce . . . . .	30
<b>Table 3.3</b> Selected indicators and means of verification for monitoring implementation and use of the national HRH information and monitoring system to support decision-making. . . . .	35
<b>Table 4.1</b> Key indicators and means of verification for measuring entry into the health workforce. . . . .	44
<b>Table 5.1</b> Potential sources of data on health workforce transitions and exits . . . . .	51
<b>Table 5.2</b> Annual numbers of overseas-trained nurses obtaining national licensure to practise in the United Kingdom, 1998–2007 (main countries of origin outside the European Economic Area) . . . . .	54
<b>Table 5.3</b> Estimates of annual losses due to mortality under age 60 among health workers in selected countries of the WHO Africa Region, based on life table analysis . . . . .	55
<b>Table 6.1</b> Percentage distribution of expenditure by type of health-care agent, Mexico health accounts, 1995. . . . .	73
<b>Table 6.2</b> Percentage distribution of expenditure by main providers, Peru health accounts, 2000 . . . . .	73
<b>Table 6.3</b> Remuneration components in the “use” table of the income account, System of National Accounts . . . . .	74
<b>Table 6.4</b> National accounts supply and use table, South Africa, 2002 (millions Rand, partial display) . . . . .	75
<b>Table 7.1</b> Estimated number of new graduates entering the public sector facility-based health workforce, by cadre, Nigeria 2005 . . . . .	87
<b>Table 7.2</b> Number and density of facility-based health workers, by cadre, Zambia 2006 HFC . . . . .	88

预览已结束，完整报告链接和二维码如下：

[https://www.yunbaogao.cn/report/index/report?reportId=5\\_29192](https://www.yunbaogao.cn/report/index/report?reportId=5_29192)



云报告  
https://www.yunbaogao.cn

云报告  
https://www.yunbaogao.cn

云报告  
https://www.yunbaogao.cn