MICROBIOLOGICAL RISK ASSESSMENT SERIES



Enterobacter sakazakii and Salmonella in powdered infant formula

MEETING REPORT





The designations employed and the presentation of the material in this publication do not imply the expression of any opinion whatsoever on the part of the World Health Organization nor of the Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations concerning the legal or development status of any country, territory, city or area or of its authorities, or concerning the delimitation of its frontiers or boundaries.

The views expressed herein are those of the authors and do not necessarily represent those of the World Health Organization nor of the Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations nor of their affiliated organization(s).

The World Health Organization and the Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations do not warrant that the information contained in this publication is complete and shall not be liable for any damage incurred as a result of its use.

WHO Library Cataloguing-in-Publication Data

Joint FAO/WHO Technical Meeting on Enterobacter sakazakii and Salmonella Powdered Infant Formula (2006: Rome, Italy) Enterobacter sakazakii and Salmonella in powdered infant formula : meeting report.

(Microbiological risk assessment series no. 10)

"Publication of the report was coordinated by Sarah Cahill. Ruth Duffy edited the report"- - Acknowledgements.

Enterobacter sakazakii – pathogenicity. 2. Salmonella – pathogenicity. 3. Infant formula.
Infant food – microbiology. 5. Food contamination. 6. Risk assessment. I. Cahill, Sarah.
II. Duffy, Ruth. III. World Health Organization. IV. Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations. V. Title. VI. Series.

ISBN 92 4 156331 1(WHO) (NLM classification: QW 138.5.E5) ISBN 92 5 105574 2 (FAO) ISSN 1726-5274

All rights reserved. Requests for permission to reproduce or translate the material contained in this publication – whether for sale or for non-commercial distribution – should be addressed to the Chief, Electronic Publishing Policy and Support Branch, Information Division, Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations, Viale delle Terme di Caracalla, 00153 Rome, Italy (fax: +39 06 57052256; e-mail: copyright@fao.org) or to WHO Press, World Health Organization, 20 Avenue Appia, 1211 Geneva 27, Switzerland (fax: +41 22 7914806; e-mail: permissions@who.int).

For further information on the joint FAO/WHO activities on microbiological risk assessment, please contact:

Food Quality and Standards Service Nutrition and Consumer Protection Division Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations Viale delle Terme di Caracalla 00153 Rome, Italy

Fax: (+39) 06 57054593 E-mail: jemra@fao.org

Web site: http://www.fao.org/ag/agn

or

Department of Food Safety, Zoonoses and Foodborne Disease World Health Organization 20 Avenue Appia CH-1211 Geneva 27 Switzerland

Fax: (+41) 22 7914807 E-mail: foodsafety@who.int

Web site: http//www.who.int/foodsafety

Cover design: Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations and the World Health Organization

Cover picture: © Dennis Kunkel Microscopy, Inc. Publications of the World Health Organization can be obtained from:

WHO Press World Health Organization, 20 Avenue Appia CH-1211 Geneva 27, Switzerland Tel: (+41) 22 7913264 Fax: (+41) 22 7914857 E-mail: bookorders@who.int or on the Internet from http://www.who.int/bookorders

Publications of the Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations can be ordered from:

Sales and Marketing Group, Information Division Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations Viale delle Terme di Caracalla, 00153 Rome, Italy Fax: (+39) 06 57053360 E-mail: publications-sales@fao.org or on the Internet from http://www.fao.org/icatalog/inter-e.htm

CORRIGENDA

A minor error in the relative risk calculations for some of the preparation and handling scenarios where powdered infant formula (PIF) was reconstituted at 60° C has been identified. This means that the relative risk previously reported for certain scenarios where PIF was reconstituted at 60° C was an underestimation of the risk reduction at this reconstitution temperature. This change **does not affect the qualitative conclusions** of the expert meeting regarding the general nature of the impact of higher reconstitution temperatures in handling scenarios. The specific relative risk reductions for certain preparation and handling scenarios where PIF was reconstituted at 60° C in Tables 10, 11, 12, 15, 16 and 19 should be updated as shown below. (- indicates no change from what is currently presented in the report).

	Table 10	Table 11	Table 12
Preparation, storage and feeding scenarios	60°C	60 °C	60 °C
Refrigeration, re-warming, short feeding period	- 8.0	- 18.0	-31.1
Refrigeration, no re-warming, extended feeding period	- 13.7	- 24.1	-25.5
Refrigeration, no re-warming, short feeding period	- 13.7	- 30.5	-52.7
No refrigeration, re-warming, extended feeding period	-	-	-3.1
No refrigeration, re-warming, short feeding period	- 10.1	- 33	-98.1
No refrigeration, no re-warming, Extended feeding period	- 1.5	-	-4.2
No refrigeration, no re-warming, short feeding period	- 14.6	- 41.1	-98.1

	Table 15	Table 16
Preparation, storage and feeding scenarios	60°C	60°C
Refrigeration, re-warming, 0.33 hour feeding period	-6	-15
Refrigeration, re-warming, 1 hour feeding period	-	-3
No refrigeration, re-warming, 0.33 hour feeding period	-8	-28
No refrigeration, re-warming, 1 hour feeding period	-	-6

	Table 19
Scenarios	60°C
Cool room temperature (20°C)	
1: Mix in bottle, cool & hold for 1 hour, no re-warming, then feed within 20 minutes	-10
2: Mix in a bottle then cooled within 5 minutes to 37°C, and feeding for 20 minutes (37°C)	-14
3: 25 L container, no refrigeration, 1 hour holding, 30 minutes feeding	> - 100,000
4: 25L container, 1 hour prep time, refrigeration 6 hours, re-warmed, 30 minutes feeding	-44
5: 1L container, no refrigeration, 1 hour holding, 30 minutes feeding	-14
6: 11 container, 1 hour prep. time, refrigeration 6 hours, re-warm, 30 minutes feeding	-2.1
Warm room temperature $(30^{\circ}C)$	
1: Mix in bottle, cool & hold for 1 hour, no re-warming, then feed within 20 minutes	-32
2: Mix in a bottle then cooled within 5 minutes to 37°C, and feeding for 20 minutes (37°C)	-41
3: 25 L container, no refrigeration, 1 hour holding, 30 minutes feeding	> - 100,000
4: 25L container, 1 hour prep time, refrigeration 6 hours, re-warmed, 30 minutes feeding	-2,044
5: 1L container, no refrigeration, 1 hour holding, 30 minutes feeding	-31
1 L container, 1 hour prep. time, refrigeration 6 hours, re-warm, 30 minutes feeding	-4.5

TC/M/A0707E ISBN 92-5-105574-2 ISSN 1726-5274

CONTENTS

Acknowledgements	vii
Contributors	ix
Foreword	xi
Abbreviations	xiii
Executive summary	XV
RECOMMENDATIONS	xix
1. INTRODUCTION	1
1.1 Background	1
1.2 Objectives	4
1.3 Scope	5
1.4 Microorganisms other than Enterobacter sakazakii and Salmonella	5
2. EPIDEMIOLOGICAL AND MICROBIOLOGICAL ASPECTS OF ENTEROBACTER SAKAZAKII	7
2.1 Epidemiology and public health	7
2.1.1 Outbreaks: Update since 2003	9
2.2 Update on microbiological aspects	10
2.2.1 Characterization of the microorganism	10
2.2.2 Isolation and identification	11
2.2.3 Persistence in a desiccated state	12
2.2.4 Pathogenicity and virulence	13
2.3 Dose response	13
2.4 Conclusions	14
3. QUANTITATIVE RISK ASSESSMENT MODEL FOR <i>ENTEROBACTER SAKAZAKII</i>	1.5
IN POWDERED INFANT FORMULA	15
3.1 Introduction	15
3.2 Overview of the risk assessment model	15

- iii -

3.2.1 Hazard characterization13.2.2 Exposure assessment13.2.3 Risk characterization23.3 Review of the model23.4 Conclusions24. Evaluation of Risk MANAGEMENT INTERVENTIONS FOR ENTEROBACTER SAKAZAKII2IN POWDERED INFANT FORMULA24.1 Impact of control measures in the manufacturing plant24.1.2 Processing environment24.1.3 Dry-mix ingredients24.1.4 Conclusions24.2 Preparation, storage and handling practices24.2.1 Consumer practices (in hospital and at home)2	17 18 21 22
3.2.2 Exposure assessment 1 3.2.3 Risk characterization 2 3.3 Review of the model 2 3.4 Conclusions 2 4. Evaluation of RISK MANAGEMENT INTERVENTIONS FOR ENTEROBACTER SAKAZAKII 2 IN POWDERED INFANT FORMULA 2 4.1 Impact of control measures in the manufacturing plant 2 4.1.1 Current industry practices 2 4.1.2 Processing environment 2 4.1.3 Dry-mix ingredients 2 4.2 Preparation, storage and handling practices 2 4.2.1 Consumer practices (in hospital and at home) 2	18 21 22
3.2.3 Risk characterization23.3 Review of the model23.4 Conclusions24. Evaluation of RISK MANAGEMENT INTERVENTIONS FOR ENTEROBACTER SAKAZAKII2IN POWDERED INFANT FORMULA24.1 Impact of control measures in the manufacturing plant24.1.1 Current industry practices24.1.2 Processing environment24.1.3 Dry-mix ingredients24.1.4 Conclusions24.2 Preparation, storage and handling practices24.2.1 Consumer practices (in hospital and at home)2	21 22 22
3.3 Review of the model23.4 Conclusions24. Evaluation of RISK MANAGEMENT INTERVENTIONS FOR ENTEROBACTER SAKAZAKIIIN POWDERED INFANT FORMULA24.1 Impact of control measures in the manufacturing plant24.1.1 Current industry practices24.1.2 Processing environment24.1.3 Dry-mix ingredients24.1.4 Conclusions24.2 Preparation, storage and handling practices24.2.1 Consumer practices (in hospital and at home)2	22 22
3.4 Conclusions 2 4. Evaluation of RISK MANAGEMENT INTERVENTIONS FOR ENTEROBACTER SAKAZAKII 2 IN POWDERED INFANT FORMULA 2 4.1 Impact of control measures in the manufacturing plant 2 4.1.1 Current industry practices 2 4.1.2 Processing environment 2 4.1.3 Dry-mix ingredients 2 4.1.4 Conclusions 2 4.2 Preparation, storage and handling practices 2 4.2.1 Consumer practices (in hospital and at home) 2	22
4. Evaluation of RISK MANAGEMENT INTERVENTIONS FOR ENTEROBACTER SAKAZAKII IN POWDERED INFANT FORMULA 2 4.1 Impact of control measures in the manufacturing plant 2 4.1.1 Current industry practices 2 4.1.2 Processing environment 2 4.1.3 Dry-mix ingredients 2 4.1.4 Conclusions 2 4.2 Preparation, storage and handling practices 2 4.2.1 Consumer practices (in hospital and at home) 2	
4.1 Impact of control measures in the manufacturing plant24.1.1 Current industry practices24.1.2 Processing environment24.1.3 Dry-mix ingredients24.1.4 Conclusions24.2 Preparation, storage and handling practices24.2.1 Consumer practices (in hospital and at home)2	23
4.1.1 Current industry practices24.1.2 Processing environment24.1.3 Dry-mix ingredients24.1.4 Conclusions24.2 Preparation, storage and handling practices24.2.1 Consumer practices (in hospital and at home)2	23
4.1.2 Processing environment24.1.3 Dry-mix ingredients24.1.4 Conclusions24.2 Preparation, storage and handling practices24.2.1 Consumer practices (in hospital and at home)2	23
4.1.3 Dry-mix ingredients24.1.4 Conclusions24.2 Preparation, storage and handling practices24.2.1 Consumer practices (in hospital and at home)2	24
4.1.4 Conclusions24.2 Preparation, storage and handling practices24.2.1 Consumer practices (in hospital and at home)2	27
4.2 Preparation, storage and handling practices 2 4.2.1 Consumer practices (in hospital and at home) 2	27
4.2.1 Consumer practices (in hospital and at home)	28
····· • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • •	28
4.2.2 Selected scenarios	28
4.2.3 Relative risk: Results of modelling	30
4.2.4 Conclusions	12
4.3 Microbiological criteria for powdered infant formula	4
4.3.1 Two-class attribute sampling plans for <i>Enterobacter sakazakii</i> in powdered infant formula	4
4.3.2 Sampling plans for Enterobacteriaceae	53
4.3.3 Consideration of the cumulative impact of sampling plans through changes in production management and lot rejection	54
4.3.4 Illustrative example of the cumulative impact of sampling plans through changes in production management and lot rejection 5	57
4.3.5 Conclusions	58
5. Salmonella in powdered infant formula	51
5.1 Epidemiology and public health	51
5.1.1 Epidemiology of <i>Salmonella</i> infections	51
5.1.2 Recent outbreaks of salmonellosis associated with powdered infant formula	51
5.2 Dose response 6	

- iv -

5.3 Update on microbiological aspects	62
5.4 Risk-reduction strategies	63
5.4.1 Current industry practices	63
5.4.2 Consideration of current microbiological criteria	65
5.4.3 Preparation and use of powdered infant formula by consumers	65
5.4.4 Need for risk assessment?	65
5.5 Conclusions	66
6. Response to Codex and recommendations	67
6.1 Response to Codex	67
6.2 Other key outcomes	71
6.3 Recommendations	72
6.4.1 To member countries, FAO and WHO	72
6.4.2 To Codex	73
6.4.3 To member countries	74
6.4.4 To industry	74
6.4.5 To FAO and WHO	74
References	75
APPENDIX A - LIST OF BACKGROUND PAPERS AND PRESENTATIONS	81
Appendix B - Data received in response to the FAO/WHO call for data	83
Appendix C - Review of Risk assessment model	85
Appendix D - Impact of reconstitution at high temperatures on other characteristics of powdered infant formula	89

- v -



https://www.yunbaogao.cn/report/index/report?reportId=5_29712



93